



**CITY OF KINGSTON**  
**REPORT TO COUNCIL**

**Report No.: 10-188**

**TO:** Mayor and Council

**FROM:** Denis Leger, Commissioner of Transportation, Properties & Emergency Services

**RESOURCE STAFF:** Sheila Kidd, Director of Transportation Services  
Robert (Bud) Steele, Fleet Manager

**DATE OF MEETING:** June 15, 2010

**SUBJECT:** RFP F31-CS-FL-2010-16 Three Multifunctional Dual Traction Sidewalk Tractor

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:**

The Fleet Services Division issued an RFP on behalf of the Public Works Department for the purchase of three multifunctional dual traction sidewalk tractors. Four submissions came forward, three of which could not be included in the evaluation process as they did not meet the requested specifications. The proposal from Amaco Construction Equipment Inc. is the only qualifying proposal brought forward. Because only one bid was received staff does not have delegated authority for this purchase and require Council approval to proceed.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

**THAT** the RFP F31-CS-FL-2010-016 for the purchase of three multifunctional dual traction sidewalk tractors be awarded to Amaco Construction Equipment Inc. The total purchase price of the three machines is \$478,884 plus applicable taxes.

**AUTHORIZING SIGNATURES:**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER _____ Denis Leger, Commissioner of Transportation, Properties & Emergency Services
ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER _____ Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

**CONSULTATION WITH THE FOLLOWING COMMISSIONERS:**

Cynthia Beach, <i>Sustainability &amp; Growth</i>	N/A
Terry Willing, <i>Community Services</i>	N/A
Denis Leger, <i>Transportation, Properties &amp; Emergency Services</i>	N/A
Jim Keech, President, <i>Utilities Kingston</i>	√

*(N/R indicates consultation not required)*

June 15, 2010

Page 2 -

**OPTIONS/DISCUSSION:**

The Fleet Services Division issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on behalf of the Public Works Department for the purchase of three Multifunctional Dual Traction Sidewalk Tractors.

The response to the RFP is as follows:

Vendor	Rank	Purchase Price (excluding applicable tax)
Amaco Construction Equipment Inc. - Cameleon	1	\$478,884

Staff reviewed and evaluated the proposal utilizing the point scheme shown.

**Table 1 - Evaluation of Proposals**

	Value %
Price	30%
Functionality	25%
Fuel economy	15%
Ergonomics	10%
Delivery	10%
Serviceability	5%
Warranty	5%
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>100%</b>

When staff reviewed the proposal, the above-noted criteria was considered which included company profile as well as the ability to provide parts, service and warranty representation for the proposed product. This RFP took into consideration all aspects of the Green Fleet Policy.

Multifunctional/dual traction, as outlined to bidders, means that the machine uses a track system for maximum traction during the plow season and is convertible to wheels for the remaining months of the year to accommodate other seasonal functions such as sweeping, grass cutting and the operation of a boom flail for ditch cutting. The Amaco Construction Equipment Inc. submission "Cameleon" was the only submission that offered conversion ability from tracks to wheels. There is only one other machine on the market with that feature. That company did acquire our RFP request package however did not submit a bid.

The units offered by Holder of North America, Town Municipal and Construction Ltd. and Cubex are rubber tired, single traction, four-wheel drive machines. The City presently owns and operates similar older machines to these within the public works fleet. This type of unit, although functional in the summer, is much less productive during winter control operations. When it comes to plowing in heavy, deep snow or hard pack conditions, track machines are essential. They are able to transfer more power and motive force to the ground through the track system than their counterparts.

Single traction machines are less money to purchase as reflected in the submissions below. They, however, are not comparable to multi traction units.

June 15, 2010

Page 3 -

Holder of North America - Holder C4.8	Unable to meet specifications	\$269,500
Township Municipal & Construction Ltd. - Multi Service Vehicle	Unable to meet specifications	\$299,305
Cubex - Maclean	Unable to meet specifications	\$306,626

There are three multi traction machines presently operating within the Public Works fleet. Their decision to have the Fleet department post a request in the market place for additional dual traction machines was based on the previous performance of these units.

In 2008, at the request of Council, Public Works made a presentation to the EITP Committee, outlining options for improved winter control sidewalk service delivery. That report recommended the purchase of multifunctional dual traction sidewalk plows, and staffing increases to adequately man those units. Cameleon multifunctional dual traction sidewalk plows were acquired in 2008 and 2009, with a per-unit cost at approximately \$156,740. For 2010, the per-unit cost of the Cameleon multifunctional dual traction sidewalk plows, is \$159,628 (a 1.85% increase). Additionally, staffing increases were granted in 2009 and 2010.

Public Works observations over the last two winter seasons indicate that the Cameleon multifunctional dual traction sidewalk plows to be typically 1½ to 2 times as productive per unit, depending on weather and precipitation conditions, as wheeled type sidewalk plows. Additionally, the Cameleon sidewalk plow performs better on icy sidewalks and will cut hard packed snow and ice from sidewalk surfaces, where a wheeled sidewalk plow will not.

To achieve the same level of service, under heavy snowfall conditions, with wheeled type sidewalk plows, would require two wheeled type units, plus twice the fuel, maintenance and labour costs.

#### **GREEN FLEET POLICY:**

This purchase supports the recommendations within the Green Fleet Policy by ensuring that the recommended vehicles are the most fuel efficient within its class.

#### **EXISTING POLICY/BY LAW:**

By-law 2000-134, *a By-law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures for the City of Kingston*

#### **NOTICE PROVISIONS: N/A**

#### **ACCESSIBILITY CONSIDERATIONS: N/A**

#### **FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS:**

This purchase is funded from the 2010 capital budget as approved by Council.

#### **CONTACTS:**

Damon Wells, Director Public Works

613- 546- 4291, Ext. 2313

#### **OTHER CITY OF KINGSTON STAFF CONSULTED: N/A**

#### **EXHIBITS ATTACHED: N/A**