

Appendix A

City of Kingston

Belle Park Fairways Service Review—Draft Report and Draft Recommendations

Appendix A

| Object of Expend/Rev | Actuals | | |
|---|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| | 2001 | 2002 | 2003 |
| Revenues | | | |
| Room rental | \$195 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Locker rental | \$2,467 | \$2,550 | \$2,692 |
| Club & cart rentals | \$15,740 | \$37,629 | \$40,760 |
| Season golf rates | \$82,707 | \$53,552 | \$51,506 |
| Daily green fees | \$106,471 | \$93,324 | \$109,534 |
| Driving range fees | \$30,974 | \$39,076 | \$45,151 |
| Cafeteria revenue | \$17,898 | \$13,893 | \$16,506 |
| Golf & merchandise sale | \$2,774 | \$2,628 | \$4,495 |
| Transfer from Reserves | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Total Revenue | \$259,226 | \$242,652 | \$270,644 |
| Expenditures | | | |
| Salaries & Wages | \$53,857 | \$75,200 | \$74,547 |
| Part-time wages | \$67,880 | \$48,815 | \$60,932 |
| Overtime | \$1,713 | \$7,272 | \$7,994 |
| Shift premium & standby | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Benefits | \$63,832 | \$71,490 | \$66,246 |
| Purchases for resale | \$15,939 | \$12,317 | \$15,004 |
| Material - raw | \$16,372 | \$10,117 | \$15,642 |
| Supplies | \$10,294 | \$14,741 | \$11,198 |
| Fees, subscript, membership | \$618 | \$93 | \$93 |
| Advertising | \$2,089 | \$1,159 | \$2,298 |
| Building/Ground Mtce | \$14,237 | \$9,155 | \$15,970 |
| Utilities | \$25,099 | \$20,167 | \$17,550 |
| Contracted Services | \$11,373 | \$11,079 | \$13,707 |
| Cash over (short) | (\$479) | (\$28) | (\$671) |
| Interest and service chg | \$1,367 | \$1,369 | \$1,511 |
| Total Expenses | \$284,191 | \$282,946 | \$302,021 |
| Net Operating Budget | (\$24,965) | (\$40,294) | (\$31,377) |
| Additional Costs, Directly Related To Golf Course Operations | | | |
| Equipment allocation costs | \$30,000 | \$30,000 | \$30,000 |
| Golf cart leases | \$9,000 | \$9,000 | \$9,000 |
| Insurance premiums (2004 rates) | \$982 | \$982 | \$982 |
| Net Operating before Admin Overhead and Capital | (\$64,947) | (\$80,276) | (\$71,359) |
| Admin Overhead | | | |
| Corporate/Division overhead | \$32,000 | \$37,452 | \$29,342 |
| Supervisor Admin overhead (10%) | \$6,913 | \$7,259 | \$7,623 |
| Net Operating after Admin Overhead | (\$103,860) | (\$124,987) | (\$108,324) |
| Contribution to Capital program | \$25,000 | \$25,000 | \$25,000 |
| Total Net Position | (\$128,860) | (\$149,987) | (\$133,324) |

Appendix B

Review of Services Survey Comments

Verbatim [Including Spelling/Grammar Errors]

Belle Park Fairway

Survey #2: I think that Belle Park Golf Course provides a very important facility for senior citizens to get recreational activity at an affordable price. I strongly urge the Task Force to maintain this facility for the future. Art Bartlett.

Survey #5: The service should be provided but there must be a way of implementing more efficient management and administration – also perhaps slightly increasing user fees to offset the cost to taxpayers.

Survey #6: Forget about the LVEC, and retain services for the residents of Kingston.

Survey #10: This money might be better spent on green space on the waterfront with better jogging/walking/cycling paths. More could probably be done in this area for less money.

Survey #13: Belle Park is also very valuable for other activities besides golf...walking all year and cross-country skiing in winter.

Survey #16: The cost of memberships at other golf courses cannot be compared with Belle Park fairways as shown on your presentation chart. The other courses have watered fairways which are also created to promote good conditioned fairways, some have liquor licences. None of the courses mentioned are in a park setting so you don't find people strolling across the fairways or kids playing on and around the greens or dogs running around on the course. Despite the above mentioned problems the membership (I am a member) is very loyal to Belle Park but you cannot put Belle Park in the same category as the other courses mentioned and the membership fee for Belle Park is exactly as it should be. I have played most of the other courses and you are comparing apples to oranges. The staff at Belle Park is outstanding and given the parameters in which they have to operate and function they are hard working and dedicated. Rick and the club house staff are efficient friendly and caring. Mitch and Andy take pride in their work and do everything possible to maintain the course. Also note, that the membership donates golf clubs, shoes, golf bags etc. with the proceeds going to the Boy,s and Girl's club. The members are also willing to have the kids play along in their foursomes to help them with the etiquette and rules of golf. You will not find this at other courses. The city has a jewel here and the effects of this course go far beyond the \$200,000 cost which was refuted as not factual at the meeting at Belle Park. Belle Park Fairways gives a Quality of life to it's Senior and junior players, Friendships and the common love of the game....Don't let it go by the wayside. Thank you

Survey #20: I feel very strongly that the city should continue to support this facility that provides so many in our community with an affordable and yet challenging form of physical activity that is accessible to the majority of Kingstonians. Many people in our community would not have the opportunity to learn the game or have easy access if it were not for Belle Park. Kingston Needs this Facility!!

Survey #23: Some comments on Belle Park meeting. 1-The meeting was poorly organized. I.e. no microphone, insufficient seating. 2-Cost projections certainly left something to be desired. 3-Putting the \$200000 loss in the survey was certainly a low blow and will certainly squew the survey results. 4-If the 200K is accurate ,it shows a complete lack of planning by city staff.This number seems to come to light one week ago. What the heck have staff being doing for the last ten years? 5-Even though Ms Hickey stated at the meeting that this number would be changed online, it hasn't been. (You managed to put it in as an afterthought, is it too much to ask that you change it as you promised?) 6-I for one have no faith in the statement that money is not the driving influence for this survey. 7-I hope that the city council will not be swayed by the monetary half-truths in this survey. 8-I would think a city would be happy that several hundred seniors are out on this beautiful course and not hold up in some smoke filled Bingo hall that has been given a special dispensation by our council. 9-I may be wrong. (That's possible) This seems to be the only city organized outdoor activity provided for and participated in by seniors. (And it's not free)

Survey #24: I have been a member of several courses in the Kingston Area (Amherstview, Garrison) and Belle Park, and without a doubt, Belle Park is a "home away from home". Please don't make any changes to this course. I have read the proposed changes and it is disheartening to see what "our elected representatives" want to do with a place that I and many members and non-members call "home". I would love to speak to any of the committee members about my passion to keep Belle Park the way it is. I was unable to make the meeting at Belle Park, but I welcome a call from a committee member.

Belle Park has always been a course of adversity. It has faced environmental issues, residential stereotypes "the dump", and now the possibility to either close the course or sell it to a private buyer. DO NOT LET THIS HAPPEN. You would be crushing the lives of many senior golfers who, on their limited income, can afford this service. I can afford to pay a little more if that's what it takes, but rethink your decision if it comes down to closing the course and remember the SENIORS.

Ken Cross

Kingston, ON

Survey #25: I can't believe that the true net cost to the taxpayer of operations at Belle Park Fairways is \$200,000 per year.

Survey #28: My 8 year old sun has started playing golf last summer and we are certainly planning to enjoy golfing together at Belle Park next summer.

Survey #32: I undersood that there was more members. Does green fees revenue taken into account? Your overview qualifies Belle Park staying as a public course. I know for certain that many seniors would not be playing golf if not for Belle Park. I appreciate the dedicated workers at the course . Thank You Don Walker

Survey #37: Why does the City have to subsidise a golf course? Every other golf course runs as a business. Golf is not something we have to provide for the community - thats ridiculous! People pay to play golf. Have them pay the going rates. If you don't know what those are then check out the Landings. They offer reasonably priced golf on a maintained course and they sure as heck don't cost the taxpayer \$200,000! That is really daft. Run it as a golf course, make it viable. The driving range at

Belle Park for example is ridiculously cheap. \$100 per season for unlimited buckets of balls. The going rate is about \$10 per bucket elsewhere on public courses so charge that. A round of 18 holes is typically \$25-\$30 on a public course. Charge it. I don't see why this should cost the tax payer anything. Much better uses for tax dollars.

Survey #40: \$200 000 a year so some can go play golf... Are you serious? Improve the day camp programs for youth (only \$20 000 a year) instead!!

Survey #41: the benefits accrued to the city may be further enhanced through either of the following :
relocated the present facility to a more appropriate location and expand facility to regulation 18 holes
- have the facility presented as professionally run, not just some city department - the expansion will allow for membership increases, league play, expanded tournament schedules. Look at the city of London Ontario - 4 municipal championship courses that consistently add not only to the municipal coffers, but to the status of that municipality. A properly run facility is worth its weight in municipal benefits. The present site obviously has an environmental concern. Possibly the construction of a new facility and the maintenance of the existing 9 hole as a 'junior/senior facility would satisfy the masses.

Survey #43: There are several private businesses in the city and surrounding area that operate golf courses and I don't think the city should be competing with these private enterprises through a taxpayer subsidized golf course.

Survey #45: My main concern with this facility is that it doesn't make the best use of the resource. This is public parkland but cannot be currently accessed by more than a few individuals. Better stewardship of this parkland would enable both golfers and the rest of the community to share this resource. What I would suggest is a walking path/bike trail loop in the forested area of Belle Island, continuing along the south side of the park (a maintenance road already exists there), and leading around the back of the "Ski Hill" (so called in the city's planning maps) to its summit, where there is a nice view of the inner harbour. This could also be used for cross-country skiing in the winter. None of this would interfere with golfers; it wouldn't cost a lot; it wouldn't challenge environmentally sensitive areas; it would provide a resource similar to Lemoine's Point for residents of the old City of Kingston (easing some of the overuse of Lemoine's Point); and it would allow the park to be enjoyed by many more residents than is currently the case.

Survey #46: Facility should be run on a break even basis.

Survey #47: I feel this large sum of the taxpayers money could be spent on more important items, like upgrading the ice rinks, building a sports facility etc.

Survey #49: While a golf course is something of a caveat, the City needs to promote it better, provide the Radio station with some free passes in return for some air play about it.. boost membership prices and cover the costs or cut it.

Survey #51: Until a back condition prevented me from playing golf I enjoyed a weekly game at Belle Park. I do think it is important that a low cost easily accessed golf course is available to the public.

Survey #52: We don't think the city should be involved in this and should sell it and use the money for other things we really need.

Survey #54: Belle Park Golf course is situated within a Park, if the city does not run it then would park access be affected. The present staff at Belle Park have made some great improvements to the course and it is a positive statement about the city to tourists who golf.

Survey #55: The survey appears skewed to portray a service with a high cost, without supporting figures re: income and breakdown of assumptions re: expenditures

Survey #62: I feel that the money is well spent I use the facility and so does my son. It is one of the few places where seniors and younger players can enjoy each others company. I also see people learning a pasttime they can enjoy for a lifetime whether they play well or not.

Survey #64: I assume that the figure of \$200,000 to operate Belle Park Fairways is after income from membership and daily green fee players. It's hard to believe, considering that members must provide close to \$100,000 in fees and daily green fee players at least another \$50,000. As far as I know Belle Park only employs 2 1/2 full time persons and some students part time. Certainly they can't cost \$200,000. Belle Park does no upgrades to the course. The \$40,000 fence around the driving range wasn't necessary for the last 25 years so I don't understand why it's necessary now. I think you should be clearer about the cost of operation of this facility.

Survey #65: For the \$200000 per year you could buy green fees from any of the other courses and fill the need for subsidised rates. By offering ridiculously low membership and greens fees you are subsidising everyone who plays there. I bet 90 % of your players can well afford to pay the rates at Glen Lawrence, Westbrook or the Landings. Get out of this business and focus energy where it will do some good for the whole community!

Survey #67: The City should focus on Core Services, not duplication of services others do or can provide

Survey #68: The survey does not include vital cost data which could seriously affect peoples responses. Values missing include current market value, cost to construct(embedded value) and annual costs such as, water, electrical, sewer, garbage and any other costs that taxpayers currently pay that the golf course does not pay. There is also the issue of Lost opportunity costs, such as real estate and business taxes that the property could generate for the City. There is no indication of whether or not there is a fiscal deficit every year. Everyone needs to know these numbers before filling out this Questionnaire. I certainly hope the above information will be presented at the Public Meetings for every Project. I went up to the questions again to remove my previous votes but was unable to delete them. The lack of proper information offered to the taxpayers further clarifies the need for an independent Consultant to take control of the Review of Services Project to ensure accurate and unbiased conclusions are presented to Council.

Survey #73: Traditionally owing a golf course is a license to print money. The fact that the City cannot make money running a golf course is one issue but the larger issue is it is not a core service. The property taxes in Kingston in conjunction with user fees are already too high so rather than provide these "fringe" services Kingston should focus on providing its core services and focus on providing those as efficiently and as effectively as possible. Perhaps an arrangement could be made where the City hands over operation to a private group who upgrades the course and then turns a profit. The City could then receive a portion of the revenues and use this money to spend on infrastructure and other core services.

Finally, I think the Review of Services exercise is long overdue but an excellent project overall. I only hope that it leads to additional reviews that will include high expenditure items. Further I hope Council has the vision and strength to make some of the tough decisions that will be required to make change.

Survey #76: We worked out the approx revenue for this year and it seems that the city is not losing revenue. We are sure that by improving facilities at the course that revenue can be increased which would make it a more viable enterprise

Appendix C

City Council Meeting No. 19
Minutes
June 22, 2004

PETITIONS

1. A petition, bearing approximately 159 signatures, was received and reads as follows:

In light of the recent announcement that Belle Park Golf Course may be considered for sale or disposal does not sit well with both the members and casual players who take alot of enjoyment in being able to get the exercise at a reasonable cost. Many of these players are on a fixed income and would be denied a loss of a game they enjoy, as well as the company of their peers.

The signatures shown below are those citizen's of the City of Kingston wishing to show their displeasure at such consideration on the fate of Belle Park Fairways by the City Council.

(File No. CSU-C14-000-2004)

REFERRED TO THE COMMISSIONER OF COMMUNITY SERVICES

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- 4 Belle Park Fairways 3 Recreation Day Camps 1 Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service 2 City Property & Facility Leasing

① Please keep it open - we need all the ^{real} waterfront access for residents that we can get.

② The City should not be a landlord for businesses → Lone Star Restaurant. It is obvious that this property can be sold. Just make it a heritage property.

③ Subsidizing existing private programs as a way to make them accessible to residents is a much better choice than "footing the whole bill for camps that are not well attended anyway. Surely 73 students in a "March Break camp" can not

Name: (Optional) _____

even cover costs!

Theatre Camp is a good example for this too. The current cost to attend the city theatre camp would only be affordable by the upper middle class.

④ The City should not be in the golf course business -

we have to factor in the salaries of the staff in addition to many other costs to keep this property. It is likely that an environmental assessment in the future will close the course.

Thank you for the opportunity to respond / make comment! Rebin E

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

Belle Park Fairways

Recreation Day Camps

Lake Ontario Park Campground

Transit Charter Bus Service

City Property & Facility Leasing

1) It is important to review all of the city's services. However,
may be advisable to do all of them in a concentrated manner, in
order to assure "fair & equitable" comparisons and
assessment.

In my opinion, the City should get out of the
business of "campgrounds management" and
"golf courses/fairways;" and "transit
charter bus services."

These "businesses" can be operated in a mo

Name: (Optional) _____

effectively manner by private sector business people who are "in the business" of running business endeavours. City resources can be re-directed to "core operations" of the city (infrastructure, parks, arenas, social housing, social services, etc.).

The "transit charter bus" operator is not making \$ & it is only adding "wear & tear" on our buses/bus system.

Note: if the City decides to get out of the "campgrounds" & "fairway" business, the issue will be "land ownership." In the case of Belle Park - there are the additional issues of pollution and Belle Is.

In my opinion, the City should stay in the "recreational camps" service. It is the largest provider of this service. Given that Kipton has 30% to 25% poverty, the ability to access 'professional, accessible' daycare service is "essential." The amount of \$29,000 ~~cost~~ taxpayer & be re-assessed. My understanding is that it is a "break even" situation.

In my opinion, the City needs to comprehensively assess its "properties" and balance the community needs for space & 'fair rent' with the business requirement of capital expenditure and future capital costs.

1) Preservation of heritage building is essential. They make Kipton unique. Think of them as "asset" instead of liabilities & manage them as assets.

2) Properties Division & Cultural Services Division work together to determine fair rent/lease rates/process for non-profit organizations, yet ensure that maintenance & capital costs are covered in the rates.

3) "No free rent." Even non-profit organizations should pay - to cover maintenance, property tax, utilities & future capital enhancement.

- also - rent blight to businesses & charge commercial rate. Let "developers" develop it.

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

This is a valuable community resource. It helps to have an affordable place for children in particular to play golf. It is something that should be taken to the community it serves. That part of the community should offer free or very low cost youth activities. There is a generation of poor young people that ~~can~~ ^{can} not afford to play school sports.

Name: (Optional) N. B. Babine

Belle Park Public Meeting
Oct. 27/04

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

The Belle Park Golf Course ~~cost~~ should
membership cost be lower at \$4.75 and
~~restricted~~ restricted should be done
away on weekends and holiday

Name: (Optional) Christopher Harkness

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

I feel Belle Park Fairways should be regarded as a Park facility that generates income. How many other city parks can do this? City Park? McBurney Park? Are Parks not an intrinsic value to a City? These are just a few thoughts that should be considered in this review process.

Name: (Optional) _____

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

WHILE IT IS IMPORTANT TO
VALIDATE THE BENEFIT OF A PARTICULAR
SERVICE, IT IS JUST AS
IMPORTANT TO HAVE ACCURATE
INFORMATION PRESENTED TO
DECISION MAKERS

Name: (Optional)

Scott Doreall

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

I attended the public session at Belle Park on 27 Oct 04.
The "new" \$100K added to the capital costs in the business plan is probably necessary, particularly in light of such costs not being previously budgeted. Because this \$100K is new, I urge that city council be made aware of this being new and that council be shown a history of the past 3 or 5 years Belle Park revenue/cost to put the matter in perspective.

Name: (Optional) _____

Ray Poquin
K7K 7C6

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

I think the financial part of the presentation was very misleading to us who attended, and to the general public who see the information.

I feel that a proper and full explanation of the financials should be presented to the general public

Name: (Optional)

John McLea

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

Keep this course
open.

Name: (Optional) _____

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

The Belle Park Fairways and the surrounding areas (hill, Belle Island) are very centrally located and easily accessible by various means, car, bus, bike, foot

The whole area is very unique i.e. its proximity to three major waterways (Belleau, Cat. River & Lake) and full of interesting wildlife and flora

Preserving might hinder these

Name: (Optional) _____

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

PAGE 3 - QUESTION 10. IT WOULD BE MUCH
EASIER TO TRULY ASSESS THIS QUERY IF
MORE INFORMATION WAS PROVIDED ON HOW
THE APPROXIMATE ANNUAL COST IS ARRIVED
AT.

I HOPE THE CITY WILL NOT ABANDON THIS FACILITY
AND THAT MY FIXED INCOME WILL CONTINUE TO
ALLOW ME TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS SPORT WHICH
BEGAN AT RETIREMENT.

Name: (Optional) M.P. COOK

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

I would appreciate Belle Park
to keep as is policy.

I am Retired and get
my exercise all summer
Golfing, Hope it will stay
open.

thank you

Name: (Optional)

George K. K. K.

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

Based on my very conservative calculations
the city is financially ok to operate as it
is. In fact the city will make money.

Following are my calculations
273 members x \$300 fee = 81,900
8000 rounds x \$13.50 = 108,000
Total \$189,900

That not counting range incomes,
lockers rental, power and public rental
and concession.

Name: (Optional) C.P. Hsu

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

If you were to remove yourself from this course what summer recreation programs ~~you~~ would you provide for seniors. It is well run and looked after with pride. It is a great place to meet fellow seniors and provides a great activity for the health and wellness of the residents. If in order to reach a break even point on expenses a raise of 15 or 20 dollars per membership I ~~feel~~ feel would not hurt the members.

Name: (Optional)

Dennis P. Donald

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

Open parks to city residents.
Lake Ontario Park belongs
to the city.

Name: (Optional) _____

"We'd like to hear from you"



Please provide us with your comments.

Personal information, which includes opinions and views, collected during the Review of Services is collected under the authority of the Municipal Act 2001, and will be used to help Council make a decision on this matter. All names and comments will be included in material available to the public. If you prefer not to be identified, please do not provide your name when completing this form.

Please identify which service(s)/program(s) your comments are directed

- Belle Park Fairways Recreation Day Camps Lake Ontario Park Campground
 Transit Charter Bus Service City Property & Facility Leasing

The present leased facilities provide invaluable benefits to the city and the wide range of citizens and organizations that use these facilities. Many would cease to exist if the facilities were closed or very high rents were to be charged. The cost at \$800,000 is spread widely and many benefit and is contrast to The Belle Park facility where far fewer people benefit from a comparatively large cost. We must also continue to support Day camps for young children

Name: (Optional) Michael Wheeler.

**City of Kingston
Review of Services
Telephone Enquiry Form**

Internal - Ext. 4322

External - Ext. 4323

Date Telephone Message Received: 1 November/04

Internal [Staff] Enquiry

External [Citizen] Enquiry

Message [Verbatim]

Name: [if provided] Mr/Mrs/Ms Thomas Doyle

Its Thomas Doyle here, I'm calling regarding Belle Park Golf Course. I wish to have it remain as is. The reasons that I would give are point form. Members are, in large part seniors from what I have seen. The location of Belle Park are a short drive for these people. The cost is a concern as well for fixed income seniors who may not be able to play otherwise at some place else. These people paid taxes all their lives and I think this is something the City should consider. They will not be able to use, for instance, the new proposed LVEC centre. The area is a former dump kept in good condition and its now an environmentally friendly green spot from what I see. And this counters the seepage of contaminants. The golf course is well managed by a good fellow and his staff and I would say the bottom line here is the joy of playing golf and comradery. I have different memories, no one is trying to impress anyone or trying to sell you anything. They're here for the joy of exercise and golf.

Thank you very much. Tom Doyle.

DaCosta, Jeremy

From: Lowell |
Sent: Wednesday, October 20, 2004 6:17 PM
To: ReviewofServices: Stobarczvk. George
Cc:
Subject: Belle Park Fairways

Dear :Review of Services task force

My wife and I are active members of the Belle Park Fairways golf club and have been for the last 8 years. This is an affordable, attractive course ideally situated for the citizens of Kingston.

We understand that alternate uses for this land are severely limited given its history as a refuse site and the risk, therefore, of soil contamination.

As one of the many supporters of Belle Park, we have a few questions we would like you to answer at next week's public meeting. I am providing the questions now to allow you time to properly research and prepare your responses.

- 1 Does Belle Park make money, lose money, or break even under current operating conditions?
- 2 What are the current financial results in dollars - this year versus last year?
- 3 Will the use of pesticides be permitted on the greens if the course gets a green light? (Essential if you want playable greens)
- 4 If the course is closed, how does the city intend to use the land to generate revenues?
- 5 With the so-called contamination of the site, has the city investigated the possibility of selling or leasing the property to a private operator?

We believe that it would be shame to deprive our fellow Kingstonians of the use of this public golf course. It is a truly beautiful waterside location, and gives the city's residents and others a chance to play golf at a reasonable price.

With some investment and promotion, Belle Park Fairways could be marketed as links-style golf course that would benefit our residents and visitors alike. This is a genuine opportunity for the city of Kingston to support fair access to a high-caliber, local recreational program operated in a safe, clean and beautiful public environment.

We will be monitoring the discussions at the public hearing and trust you will address our concerns.

Yours truly
Wilma and Lowell Ostrom (members)

DaCosta, Jeremy

From: Art-Kay Bartlett [
Sent: Thursday, October 21, 2004 9:59 AM
To: ReviewofServices
Cc:
Subject: Belle Park Golf Course Future

Dear Review of Services task force,

My wife and I have enjoyed a golfing membership at Belle Park Fairways golf club for several years now and would encourage the task force to consider keeping the property as a golf recreation facility. We think it's a superb location for all citizens to get daily exercise and enjoy a beautiful scenic stroll as they golf. I was diagnosed with blood clots on both lungs two years ago and was restricted to pulling a cart with only a few clubs to prevent pain. My physician said that I should get daily exercise and Belle Park has served the purpose adequately with it's flat terrain and minimal effort to pull golf clubs. I now can pull a full set of clubs for nine hole without pain however, I still can't do eighteen holes without purchasing a power cart which adds to the cost when one is retired and on a fixed income.

We should mention the excellent camaradery that we enjoy every day we golf which comes from meeting new members and old friends daily. My wife and I golf about one hundred times a year at Belle Park Fairways (nine holes) and have enjoyed it for several years.

It would be a shame to deprive citizens of such an opportunity to exercise daily for the summer months if the course was used for other purposes.

I trust that your committee will think of the valuable resource that we have which serves the needs of all citizens

Sincerely,

Art/Kay Bartlett

11/8/2004

DaCosta, Jeremy

From: Larry B [mailto:larryb@cityofkingston.ca]
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2004 5:42 PM
To: "ReviewOfServices@cityofkingston.ca"
Cc: "Sheila Hickey"; "Director of Strategic
Subject: Belle Park Fairways

Dear Sheila

I am against the closing or privatizing Belle Park Fairways.

Belle Park is not just a Municipal golf course, but offers recreation at affordable prices to groups such as the Boys & Girls Club, Youth, Students, Seniors, and more.

I think it would be a wise decision for the City to take away this recreational program from these citizens.

The City is supposed to be in the people business, serving the community wherever it can, not like private companies that thrive on profit making.

Does the direct cost of \$170,000 shown in the brochure include all of Belle Park area, supervisory costs, capital etc.? Through conversations with other members, I am led to believe that the golf course itself will show a profit upwards to \$20,000 for year 2004. How does staff arrive at a total cost of \$200,000 charged to the golf course.

Being out of town on the 27th, I will not be able to voice my opinions at the meeting. I do however ask that you consider keeping the golf course under city management.

Thank you for hearing my opinions
Larry Barker

11/8/2004

DaCosta, Jeremy

From: Larry B []
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2004 7:42
To: ReviewofServices
Cc: Meers, Sara
Subject: Belle Park Fairways

Dear Sheila

I am against the closing or privatizing Belle Park Fairways. Belle Park is not just a Municipal golf course. It offers recreation at affordable prices to groups such as the Boys & Girls Club, Youth, Students, Seniors, and more.

I think it would **not** be a wise decision for the City to take away this recreational program from these citizens.

The City is supposed to be in the people business, serving the community wherever it can, not like private companies that thrive on profit making.

Does the direct cost of \$170,000 shown in the brochure include all of Belle Park area, all supervisory costs, capital etc.? Through conversations with other members of the club, I am led to believe that the golf course itself will show a profit upwards to \$20,000 for year 2004. How does staff arrive at a total cost of \$200,000 and fully charged to the golf course.

Being out of town on the 27th, I will not be able to voice my opinions at the meeting. I do however ask that you consider keeping the golf course the way it is now, under city management.

Thank you for hearing my opinions,
Larry Barker

11/8/2004

DaCosta, Jeremy

From: George Kops

Sent: Thursday, October 28, 2004 9:50 AM

To: ReviewofServices

Subject: Belle Park Golf Course

My name is George Kops,

I would like to provide my comments concerning the Belle Park Golf Course.

I am a retiree who chose Kingston as a place where I wanted to retire. I am not a native Kingstonian nor was I employed here. I could have chosen any place in Canada to retire but I chose Kingston. The reason is that Kingston is a very diverse city and has amenities to satisfy almost every segment of society. One of my main interests is the golf course! While there are numerous golf courses in the Kingston area the Belle Park course is unique. It is unique because it is centrally located and easy for many of us retirees to access. It can be reached by bus or a short drive, In fact a number of people walk to the course. While it is not a great golf course and many good golfers would scoff at it, the course provides many hours of healthful exercise and sociability for seniors. In this regard I strongly feel that a large segment of the population is healthier both physically and mentally. This is most important and the cost associated with this aspect is immeasurable.

There are many services provided by the city which are a direct cost to the taxpayer e.g. Libraries, parks etc. These are services which make for a good city in which to live. I believe Belle Park Golf Course also fits into this category.

I have used the golf course for 14 years now and have witnessed vast improvement in the way it is managed. I feel that the present management is doing a fine job. It is now much more professionally operated than in previous years.

Please make your consideration in this matter based on the needs of the community rather than just on finance.

11/8/2004

Appendix D

REVIEW OF SERVICES PUBLIC OPEN HOUSE

**Wednesday, October 27, 2004
Belle Park Golf Course Clubhouse
7:30 p.m.
'BELLE PARK GOLF COURSE'**

Review of Services Project Team Members Present

Sheila Hickey, Director, Strategic Initiatives and Corporate Communications
Jeremy DaCosta, Project Manager
Sharon Fitch, Project Office Assistant
Laura Seiffert, Communications
Cheryl Mastantuono, Community Services
Bert Needham, Community Services
Shawna Guemsey, Corporate Services

Members of Council Present

Councillor Smith
Councillor B. George

BMA Consulting

Jim Bruzzese
Catherine Minshull

Members of the Public Present

Approximately 112 members

**THIS IS NOT A VERBATIM REPORT
Questions and Comments Only**

1. What did the City loose last year? What were the indirect costs? Is it a depreciation cost?
2. *Vern Watters*: I started to do the survey; I started to do it as agreeing as a member until question no. 10...the annual cost to taxpayers is \$200K.....every single year???
3. Is that \$100K [capital costs] projected related to the move of holes because of the aboriginal burial grounds? This will have to be done anyway – not fair to put those costs in. Doesn't that skew the survey?
4. Are they [Council] going to make their decisions based on how much it looses [\$200K]?
5. The minutes of meetings that the Committee has been holding says the reason for the review is the City is in a deficit so how can you say they aren't taking financials into consideration?
6. One of the criteria you'll be looking at is financial – right? The part that bothers me the most is that Belle Park costs \$200K to taxpayers. Not so in the past – looks bad the way it's presented. Misleading to citizens.
7. The program is costing \$100K in indirect costs – right? How come it shows \$200K?
8. How does the \$200K compare to the \$\$millions for arenas?
9. Is there a projected cost to doing this project and the City labour to do it?
10. Why is Belle Park project under review when it's still under litigation? If the litigation comes in as a capping – why do it now?
11. Can you explain the burial ground bit? Where did it come from? We've been here 30 years – where did it come from?

12. How does Belle Park compare to the other 4 service areas – we earn over \$200K a year.
13. If we make \$300K a year, how can we be in the hole \$200K a year? Even if you take out the \$100K capital costs.
14. How do we compare to the hockey rinks?
15. You could be turning out 500 seniors who live here – you're killing them. Are you sure you haven't already made your decision?
16. This doesn't stop here – these people have children, grand kids – you close this down – we'll come after all of you.
17. I don't understand a couple of questions on the survey: No. 9 and No. 11. I want to know the intent of the questions.
18. What you're saying is our membership fees should increase by 50% to break even?
19. There is another aspect – is this course running efficiently and at full capacity?
20. One of the reasons the membership is not as high as it should be is that we don't have the same quality as the other courses.
21. Indian burial grounds – this is a very important fact. You should be [emailing, newspaper] to let people know what the costs and implications are to the golf course – totally out of our hands.
22. Has the burial ground been authenticated?
23. *Tom Murphy*: I spent 35 years in the Provincial Government so I understand about allocating costs. If you get rid of the golf course, those costs [indirect] don't go away – they'll still be there.
24. The function of this park for this end [North end] is for the seniors. The City employees are wonderful. The job done here for the elderly; the kids that wander in and out [not members] – are treated with respect. If it diverts one kid a year away from crime – it's worth it.
25. You never see that financial benefit until it's gone. These boys are in dire need of a role model. They see men don't have to be perhaps what they know in their own lives. Workers who just get shifted around – no save in \$\$'s. Does the City get some form of grant for these students for summer employment?
26. How can you say the whole island is a burial ground when part of it [the waterway] is man made?
27. When you're talking about fees – other 9 hole courses are comparable – we also deal with other things – dog walking, Boys & Girls Club – other courses don't do that.
28. Moving the green will work [aboriginal burial ground] – moving the tee won't.
29. The chart with the fees – is that based on 2004? Green Acres [Gananoque] wasn't listed. Some facts are incorrect. Glen Lawrence figures are incorrect. Not fair to compare to Westport.
30. If you're going to do the survey, cross off question no. 10 – worded badly.
31. If Councillors make a decision on what we give them – [burden to the taxpayer]. I have a lot of experience with arenas and user fees. It's the most important issue here.

32. *George Kobbs [sp?]*: I wasn't brought up and didn't work in Kingston but chose to retire here because it has a diverse population – ranks next to Victoria B.C. as far as seniors. The golf course was big in making the decision to move here. If it goes down hill, [privatization], would loose a lot. Sure hope we can keep it.
33. Will the fate of this course be in the hands of Councillors?
34. Since you and your office have been facilitating – you have made many recommendations. Have you been denied any of your recommendations?
35. I'm unsure of the process – when will the minutes of this meeting be made available? I don't trust the company taking the notes to record what is actually being said.
36. Is Council aware that there used to be a ski hill here and that it disappeared without any hullabaloo?
37. I think what people are concerned about – we leave here – big black hole. You guys go away and we never hear from you again.
38. Will the draft recommendations be on your website?
39. The concern is that the decision has already been made and what is going to happen to the golf course. Lack of trust. Not going to be another LVEC is it?
40. So, if in January I look on your website – there will be a draft plan?
41. I've been here [as a member] since 12 – I'm now 40 – if you close this place down – biggest disservice to this City.
42. You're only talking about 5 services – there are more services the City looks after – if we're not talking about improving the golf course, what are we talking about? Why 5 services out of 100's picked – not clear to me.
43. So let's say you do make a judgment on these 5 services – how does that affect the rest?
44. Are you wanting to improve the service or the costs?
45. If your recommendations are pending January 2005 – that's pretty prompt. This group of people won't be as informed as if it were golf season. Council should look at that. Recommendations – put off until June 2005 when people are together daily – now people are missing out – people go to Florida.
46. In June, Council could have a first hand look at how this place operates. These people don't have the trust in consultants when we voted in Councillors – taking people's lives into their hands.
47. Doesn't bode well if we make a decision in January.
48. Could the recommendations be mailed to the membership list?
49. The reason I play golf here is because I choose to – I don't fit into your public policy objectives [lower income, etc.]