



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 16-010**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston
Resource Staff: Mark Van Buren, Director of Engineering
Date of Meeting: December 15, 2015
Subject: Preliminary Design for the Third Crossing of the Cataraqui River
Award of Contract

Executive Summary:

The purpose of this report is to advise Council on the outcome of the evaluation of proposals received in response to the RFP for Preliminary Design for the Third Crossing and to seek approval of the recommendation of staff.

A Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued on October 7, 2015 seeking the provision of professional engineering services from qualified firms to complete the preliminary design of the Third Crossing. The RFP closed on November 4, 2015 with a total of five (5) proposals received. A City review team evaluated each of the proposals based upon criteria established and specifically documented within the RFP document. The City review team concluded that the proposal provided by JL Richards, which was not the lowest bidder for the work, ranked first in scoring, and offered the most comprehensive submission in response to the RFP and the best value for the City of Kingston to complete the preliminary design work for the Third Crossing.

Staff is not recommending the lowest bid for this project therefore Council approval is required to proceed with the recommended proposal as per the City's purchasing policies.

Recommendation:

That Council authorize the Mayor and Clerk to enter into a contract in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services with JL Richards, for the preliminary design of the Third Crossing of the Cataraqui River.

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY PRESIDENT & CEO, UTILITIES KINGSTON

Jim Keech, President & CEO, Utilities Kingston

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Commissioners:

Cynthia Beach, Corporate & Strategic Initiatives	Not required
Lanie Hurdle, Community Services	Not required
Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	

Options/Discussion:

Background

At the meeting of Council held on September 15, 2015, a report from staff (Report Number 15-268) provided Council with an update to the Third Crossing Action Plan. Council approved the recommendations of this report with direction to staff to advance work on both the preliminary design (Phase 2) and financial plan (Phase 3) for the Third Crossing of the Cataraqui River. A Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued on October 7, 2015 seeking the provision of professional engineering services from qualified firms to complete the preliminary design of the Third Crossing. The RFP closed on November 4, 2015 with a total of five (5) proposals received from the following engineering consulting firms:

- Brown Co/BT Engineering
- Buckland & Taylor
- GHD
- JL Richards
- MMM Group

Evaluation of Proposals

The City review team consisting of staff members from the Engineering Department and Transportation Services Department were involved in the independent review and evaluation of each of the submissions received. The evaluation process, which was outlined in detail in the RFP document, included the following evaluation criteria:

- Experience, Qualifications and Availability of Team Members – 20%
- Understanding of Objectives, Proposed Work Plan, Schedule, and Level of Effort – 22%
- Creativity, Innovation and Vision, Quality of Approach and Methodology - 30%
- Accessibility – 3%
- Financial Proposal – 25%

After a preliminary review and ranking of the five proposals, staff developed a shortlist of three preferred proposals based on an interim scoring of these proposals which included:

1. JL Richards
2. GHD
3. MMM Group

Representatives from these three consulting firms were invited to meet individually with the City review team to provide a 30-minute presentation that highlighted elements of their proposal followed by a question period conducted by the City review team which provided an opportunity to confirm, clarify, and further explore elements of the proposals submitted by these three consultants. Information provided as part of these consultant interviews was then used as an additional means to finalize the proposal scores of these three consultants.

Consultant Selection

The evaluation of all proposals by the City review team has concluded that the proposal provided by JL Richards provides the most thorough submission in response to the RFP and also represents the best value for undertaking the necessary preliminary design work for the Third Crossing project. The table below provides information related to rank, price, and total proposal score for each of the 5 submissions received.

Proponent	Technical Score	Financial Score	(Bid Price) (HST Excl.)	Total Score	Rank Score
J.L. Richards	65.5	14.4	(\$2,350,000.00)	80	1
GHD Limited	55.0	19.2	(\$1,791,565.00)	74	2
MMM Group	44.0	25.0	(\$1,350,740.00)	69	3
Buckland & Taylor	35.5	24.4	(\$1,384,866.00)	60	4
Brown Co/BT Eng	35.0	15.3	(\$2,203,785.00)	50	5

While each of the proposals were received from reputable firms, the City review team awarded the proposal provided by JL Richards with the highest score receiving 80 out of 100 points. With the exception of points allocated to JL Richards for their financial proposal as calculated based upon the objective criteria defined in the RFP document, the proposal from JL Richards scored higher on the majority of the other non-financial evaluation categories both overall and consistently amongst all members of the City review team.

The proposal from JL Richards proposed a team that was highly qualified with demonstrated local, regional and international experience that was aided by both (i) their involvement in the Environmental Assessment work for the Third Crossing and (ii) the team's direct and unique experience in the recent design and construction management of the recently completed Vimy Memorial Bridge in Ottawa, Ontario. An experienced team with a close working relationship with Parks Canada will be critical to the success of the Preliminary Design phase on several levels. The Vimy Memorial Bridge and Third Crossing both cross the Rideau River and therefore are part of the same international UNESCO World Heritage designation which is administered by Parks Canada. In addition, Parks Canada is a major stakeholder since they are the land owner for which the Third Crossing is situated. Additionally, the JL Richards proposal provided a more comprehensive work plan with a superior project approach and methodology that best reflected the importance of regularly sharing and reviewing of technical data, in depth stakeholder involvement and decision making based on a sound consensus-building philosophy. JL Richards will design an aesthetic and sustainable world class signature bridge whose components will safely and effectively serve its intended purpose and minimize the total cost of ownership for all stakeholders. JL Richards will incorporate a variety of innovative features such as intelligent monitoring systems (smart technology); high performance materials and constructability techniques; and provide opportunities for public engagement that offer participation and collaboration on a range of project design elements (e.g. architectural features, landscaping, and active transportation amenities) that best serve community residents and visitors.

City staff recognizes that the financial proposal provided by JL Richards is the highest of the five financial proposals received and significantly higher than the lowest bid. That being the case, the City review team has still determined that the proposal provided by JL Richards represents the best value for the City of Kingston to undertake the preliminary design for the Third Crossing project. Critical project tasks were allocated greater resources under the JL Richards proposal compared to their competitors. Furthermore, the financial proposal by JL Richards to undertake the project assignment falls within the expected Phase 2 budget which was approved in September 2015. The budget estimate for the project was based on an industry standard calculation for anticipated engineering fees as a percentage of overall construction costs which was determined well before the RFP was issued. In this respect, the proposals provided by GHD and MMM Group each proposed an allocation of resources expressed in both total person-hours as well as methodology that was approximately one-third (1/3) less inclusive than the proposal submitted by JL Richards. The City review team were unable to discern information in the project work plan, schedule, or methodology from neither GHD nor MMM Group that proposed an approach to the project work assignment that would either yield efficiencies or alternate approaches sufficient to justify any reduction of effort or resources on this project.

As a result, the City review team recommends the award of contract for the preliminary design of the Third Crossing to JL Richards as their proposal reflects best value for money as well as the proper level of effort to be given on project critical tasks and the project in general in regards to the importance of the preliminary design for the Third Crossing project.

Existing Policy/By Law:

By-Law No. 2000-134 – A By-Law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures.

Notice Provisions:

Not applicable.

Accessibility Considerations:

Accessibility was one of the criteria used to evaluate the proposals received. JL Richards demonstrated an understanding of the current accessibility legislation as it relates to communications and design principals and detailed means by which accessibility considerations would be factored into the preliminary design work assignment for the Third Crossing.

Financial Considerations:

There are sufficient funds in the approved budget to undertake the preparation of the preliminary design for the Third Crossing.

Contacts:

Mark Van Buren, Director of Engineering, 613-546-4291 Ext. 3218

Dan Franco, Supervising Engineer, 613-546-4291 Ext. 3226

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

Alan McLeod, Senior Legal Counsel

Exhibits Attached:

Not applicable.