



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 16-044**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston
Resource Staff: Damon Wells, Director of Public Works
Date of Meeting: January 26, 2016
Subject: Award of Request for Proposal – 2016 Tree Removals for Emerald Ash Borer

Executive Summary:

The City of Kingston developed an Emerald Ash Borer Impact Cost Mitigation Plan in 2014 to deal with the presence of the Emerald Ash Borer invasive beetle that kills ash trees over the course of two to six years. Ash tree removals are just one component of the plan. Trees are evaluated for removal based on several factors including size, health, structure, location and infrastructure conflict.

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award the 2016 tree removal contract for the Emerald Ash Borer project. Council approval is required as it is recommended that the contract be awarded to the highest scoring proponent based on the evaluation criteria as set out in the RFP document and not necessarily the lowest priced proposal.

Staff evaluated all proposals utilizing the criteria that was specifically outlined in the RFP document and concluded that the proposal by Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited ranked first in the scoring, provided the most thorough submission in response to the RFP and the best value for the City.

Section 3.4 iii) of the Purchasing By-Law requires that approval be sought by separate report to Council when the lowest bid or proposal is not accepted.

January 26, 2016

Page 2 of 6

Recommendation:

That RFP No. 'F31-PWS-PW-2015-14 2016 Emerald Ash Borer Tree Removals' be awarded to Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited for the total price of \$ 88,639.00 plus applicable taxes; and

That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to execute a contract with Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

January 26, 2016

Page 3 of 6

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY PRESIDENT & CEO, UTILITIES KINGSTON

Jim Keech, President & CEO, Utilities Kingston

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Commissioners:

Cynthia Beach, Corporate & Strategic Initiatives	Not required
Lanie Hurdle, Community Services	Not required
Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required

January 26, 2016

Page 4 of 6

Options/Discussion:

On Wednesday November 25, 2015, nine (9) Request for Proposal (RFP) submissions were received for RFP No. F31-PWS-PW-2015-15 2016 Emerald Ash Borer Tree Removals. All proposals were reviewed by staff and scored on the criteria set out in the RFP. Proposals were evaluated on demonstrated relevant experience in a municipal setting, understanding of the project scope requirements, project execution, scheduling and accessibility considerations. The scope and complexity of the 2016 Emerald Ash Borer Tree Removals was clearly described in the RFP. The below table identifies the weightings specified in the RFP for the evaluations. The weighting for the financial component of the RFP was determined to be 55 percent and is within the range of 25 to 75 percent as prescribed within the City’s purchasing policy. Staff believe that this is an acceptable weighting for the financial component and reflects a reasonable balance between price and experience, qualifications and project execution plan described in the proposals received.

Evaluation Criteria	Weighting
Stipulated Price	55
Proponent References and Experience	18
Proposal Content	4
Project Schedule and Execution Plan	18
Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	5
Total	100

Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited (Treescape) provided the most comprehensive and thorough submission in response to the RFP. Treescape provided an experienced and qualified team with all of the required certifications for the project, including equipment and environmental considerations including proper equipment refueling. A detailed project schedule was supplied with milestones for deliverables by project area and a completion date, which meet the project requirements. Treescape provided three municipal contractor references including a contract with The City of Mississauga for Ash Tree and Stump Removals for a three year term. The reference provided excellent reviews indicating Treescape provided the highest of quality work and superior customer relations with minimal customer interruption. Treescape also provided a detailed accessible customer service standard compliance document in support of this contract to ensure accessibility in proximity to the job sites. The proposal provided by Treescape represents the best value for the City of Kingston in completing the requested services. The Treescape proposal was ranked as the best technical submission of all the proposals received, which included a concise execution plan and project schedule to complete the project requirements within the timeline stated in the RFP. Treescape clearly demonstrated their understanding of the scope and complexity of the 2016 Emerald Ash Borer Tree Removals contract as described in the RFP.

January 26, 2016

Page 5 of 6

The proposal received from Tim Allen's Tree Service was ranked the lowest technical submission of the proposals received. They did not demonstrate, as requested in the RFP, relevant municipal tree removal projects along streets, in parks and around high voltage power lines. The proponent also did not provide a project execution plan clearly describing the approach and methodology to be followed in completing all aspects of the work in order to achieve safe and timely completion of the project objectives. The project schedule supplied was unclear on deliverables and did not include a list of qualified or certified Arborists who will be utilized in the work. In evaluating the proposal staff determined that the lack of detail in the supplied project schedule and failure to provide a project execution plan failed to describe an understanding of the project and thus provides additional risk to the City for completion of this project. The risk is associated with failure to meet the prescribed deadline to have all trees removed in advance of legislative requirements and spring planting schedules, as well as the impact on ensuring accessibility and superior customer service. While this proposal was the lowest priced, it was ranked the lowest technical submission of the proposals received and resulted in an overall second place ranking.

As per Section C: General Terms and Conditions of the RFP for bids over \$50,000 as well as the requirements in the City's Purchasing By-Law 2000-134 as amended, when recommending a proponent other than the lowest bid, the pricing component and the ranking of all accepted submissions are reported to Council:

Proponent	Rank (using criteria in RFP)	Technical Score	Financial Score	Total Score	Bid Price Submitted (HST excluded)
Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited	1	39	27.5	66.5	\$88,639.00
Tim Allen's Tree Service	2	10.5	55	65.5	\$44,060.00
Ontario Line Clearing & Tree Services 2010 Ltd.	3	28.5	32.5	61	\$74,721.00
Hybrid Construction Group	4	31.5	20.5	52	\$119,100.00
Western Landscape Services	5	15	34	49	\$70,820.69
Davey Tree Expert Co. of Canada Limited	6	29.5	17	46.5	\$144,170.53
2229636 ON Inc. O/A Woodsman Construction and Tree Services	7	20.5	25.5	46	\$95,287.50
1251400 Ontario Limited O/A Instant Shade	8	17.5	19	36.5	\$128,454.00
O'Brien Tree Service	9	19.5	16.5	36	\$147,900.00

January 26, 2016

Page 6 of 6

Existing Policy/By Law:

By-Law 2000-134 A By-Law to establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures

Notice Provisions:

Not applicable.

Accessibility Considerations:

Accessibility was one of the criteria used to evaluate the proposals. Treescape demonstrated a great understanding of the current accessibility legislation as well as the City's Facility accessibility design standards.

Financial Considerations:

The undertaking of the EAB program has budget approval as part of the Public Works multi-year capital plan.

Contacts:

Damon Wells, Director, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 2313

Troy Stubinski, Operations Manager, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 2183

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

Sydney Buckler, Supervisor, Public Works Department

Dan Cuthill, Capital Projects Coordinator, Engineering Department

Exhibits Attached:

Not applicable.