



**City of Kingston  
Report to Council  
Report Number 16-101**

---

**To:** Mayor and Members of Council

**From:** Denis Leger, Commissioner of Transportation, Facilities and  
Emergency Services

**Resource Staff:** Sheila Kidd, Director of Transportation Services

**Date of Meeting:** March 22, 2016

**Subject:** Award of Contract – Two Ice Resurfacers

---

**Executive Summary:**

The Fleet Services Division issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on behalf of the Recreation Facilities Division, for the purchase of two ice resurfacers to replace existing units that have fulfilled lifecycle expectations. Council approval is required because only two submissions to the RFP were received and staff is not recommending the lowest bid, therefore staff does not have delegated authority to proceed with the purchase.

**Recommendation:**

**That** Zamboni Company Inc. be awarded the contract for the purchase of two ice resurfacers (RFP F31-TPES-TS-FL-2016-3), for the total purchase price of \$159,800 plus applicable taxes for both machines; and

**That** the Commissioner of Transportation, Facilities, and Emergency Services be authorized to execute the required agreements, in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

March 22, 2016

Page 2 of 5

**Authorizing Signatures:**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER

**Denis Leger, Commissioner of  
Transportation, Facilities and  
Emergency Services**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

**Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer**

**Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:**

Cynthia Beach, Corporate & Strategic Initiatives	Not required
Lanie Hurdle, Community Services	
Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services	Not required
Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required

March 22, 2016

Page 3 of 5

**Options/Discussion:**

The Fleet Services Division issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on behalf of the Recreation Facilities Division, for the purchase of two ice-resurfacing machines to replace existing units that have fulfilled lifecycle expectations. The submissions were evaluated using the following criteria:

- Pricing and Related Costs - 35%
- Specification compliant, including ergonomics, driver comfort and unit performance - 30%
- Fuel Economy and greenhouse gas emissions - 22%
- Warranty - 10%
- Accessibility Standards for Customer Service, Ontario Regulation 429/7 - 3%

Two submissions were received for this RFP. The staff evaluation resulted in the following ranking:

- Zamboni Company Limited ranked #1 with a score of 95 out of 100
- Resurface Corporation ranked #2 with a score of 93 out of 100

Resurface Corporation submitted a bid of \$155,700 plus applicable taxes for two Olympia ice-resurfacing machines and Zamboni Company Limited offered two Zamboni units for a total purchase price of \$159,800 plus applicable taxes.

These manufacturers are the primary suppliers in this class of machinery. Resurface Corporation produces the Olympia machine, and the Zamboni Company produces a machine bearing their company name. Both machines are capable and well supported regarding servicing, parts supply, and warranty.

The proposal submitted by Zamboni Company Limited is being recommended as it attained the highest score, primarily in the areas of fuel efficiency and greenhouse gas emissions statistics.

The Zamboni unit uses a 2.4 litre four-cylinder 59-horsepower engine and propels the machine through hydrostatics, which is essentially a hydraulic pump driven by the engine that supplies motive power to hydraulic motors at the wheels. The Resurface option uses a 4.3 litre six-cylinder motor producing 170-horsepower driving the wheels through a conventional automatic transmission. Both units are four-wheel drive.

The hydrostatic propulsion system on the Zamboni unit uses a smaller engine to drive the hydraulics allowing the engine to run at a constant speed during resurfacing operations. This generally results in better hydraulic system function and greater fuel efficiency.

The source of fuel for both products is liquid propane. The Zamboni uses 13.22 pounds of liquid propane per hour compared to the Olympia that uses 16.58 pounds of fuel per hour. This class

March 22, 2016

Page 4 of 5

of machine has a minimum lifecycle of 6,000 operating hours. Based on the fuel consumption provided in each submission and the minimum lifecycle operating hours, each Zamboni unit will use 20,160 fewer pounds of liquid propane than the Resurface unit. Based on the current cost of liquid propane at \$1.35 per pound, the cost difference over the lifecycle of these units is calculated as follows:

- The two Zamboni machines would use 158,640 pounds of propane over their lifecycle at a cost of \$1.35 per pound totalling \$214,164.
- The two Resurface Olympia machines would use 198,960 pounds of propane over the projected lifecycle at a cost of \$1.35 per pound totalling \$268,596.

The City currently owns and operates ice-resurfacing machines from both manufacturers, which provided the ability to compare maintenance data on both types of machines. Three units from each manufacturer with similar in-service hours were compared on a maintenance cost per hour basis. The average maintenance cost per hour of the Olympia machines is \$14.23 compared to \$8.03 for the Zamboni machines. This analysis further reinforces the recommendation to award the contract to Zamboni Company Ltd.

**Existing Policy/By-law:**

*By-law 2000-134, a By-law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures for the City of Kingston*

*Green Fleet Policy for the City of Kingston*

The Zamboni unit proposed uses 13.22 pounds per hour of propane at full operating RPMs. The Canadian Propane Association states that propane vehicles emit up to 26% fewer GHGs than gasoline-powered vehicles.

**Notice Provisions:**

Not Applicable

**Accessibility Considerations:**

Not Applicable

**Financial Considerations:**

This purchase will be funded from monies previously approved in the 2016 Fleet capital budget.

**Contacts:**

Sheila Kidd, Director of Transportation Services, 613-546-4291, Extension 2221  
Robert (Bud) Steele, Manager of Fleet, 613-546-4291, Extension 2216

**March 22, 2016**

Page 5 of 5

**Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:**

Adam McCluskey, Manager, Recreation Facilities

**Exhibits Attached:**

Not Applicable