



**City of Kingston  
Report to Council  
Report Number 16-177**

---

**To:** Mayor and Members of Council  
**From:** Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston  
**Resource Staff:** Damon Wells, Director of Public Works  
**Date of Meeting:** June 7, 2016  
**Subject:** Award of Contract – 2016 Stump Grinding for Emerald Ash Borer

---

**Executive Summary:**

The City of Kingston developed an Emerald Ash Borer Impact Cost Mitigation Plan in 2014 to deal with the presence of the Emerald Ash Borer invasive beetle. Ash tree stump removals are just one component of the plan. Tree stumping is the last important step to facilitate new tree planting in the fall, if no infrastructure conflicts exist.

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award the 2016 tree stump removal contract for the Emerald Ash Borer project. Council approval is required as it is recommended that the contract be awarded to the highest scoring proponent based on the evaluation criteria as set out in the RFP document and not necessarily the lowest priced proposal.

Staff evaluated all proposals utilizing the criteria that was specifically outlined in the RFP document and concluded that the proposal by Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited ranked first in the scoring, provided a clear understanding of the project scope in response to the RFP and the best value for the City.

Section 3.4 iii) of the Purchasing By-Law requires that approval be sought by separate report to Council when the lowest bid or proposal is not accepted.

**Recommendation:**

**That** the contract for Emerald Ash Borer Tree Stump Removals be awarded to Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited for the total price of \$ 106,508.00 plus applicable taxes; and

**That** the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to execute a contract with Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

**Authorizing Signatures:**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY PRESIDENT & CEO, UTILITIES KINGSTON

**Jim Keech, President and CEO,  
Utilities Kingston**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

**Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer**

**Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:**

Cynthia Beach, Corporate & Strategic Initiatives	Not required
Lanie Hurdle, Community Services	Not required
Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required

**Options/Discussion:**

On Wednesday May 4, 2016, seven (7) Request for Proposal (RFP) submissions were received for RFP No. F31-PWS-PW-2016-18 2016 Emerald Ash Borer Tree Stump Removals. All proposals were reviewed by staff and scored on the criteria set out in the RFP. Proposals were evaluated on demonstrated relevant experience in a municipal setting, understanding of the project scope requirements, project execution, scheduling and accessibility considerations. The scope and complexity of the 2016 Emerald Ash Borer Tree Stump Removals was clearly described in the RFP.

The table below identifies the weightings specified in the RFP for the evaluations. The weighting for the financial component of the RFP was determined to be 50 percent and is within the range of 25 to 75 percent as prescribed within the City’s purchasing policy. Staff believe that this is an acceptable weighting for the financial component and reflects a reasonable balance between price, experience and qualifications and project execution plan described in the proposals received.

Evaluation Criteria	Weighting
Stipulated Price	50
Proponent References and Experience	20
Proposal Content	3
Project Schedule and Execution Plan	23
Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	4
<b>Total</b>	<b>100</b>

Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited (Treescape) provided a comprehensive and thorough submission in response to the RFP. Treescape provided an experienced and qualified team with certifications and training to support the project, including a detailed equipment list to be used on the project. Environmental considerations were also outlined including proper equipment refueling. A detailed project schedule was supplied with milestones for deliverables by project area and a completion date, which meet the project requirements. Treescape provided three municipal contractor references including a contract with The City of Mississauga for Ash Tree and Stump Removals for a three year term with a detailed scope of work description. Treescape also provided a detailed accessible customer service standard compliance document in support of this contract to ensure accessibility in proximity to the job sites.

The proposal provided by Treescape represents the best value for the City of Kingston in completing the requested services. The Treescape proposal was ranked as the second best technical submission of all the proposals received, which included a concise execution plan and project schedule to complete the project requirements within the timeline stated in the RFP. Completing this contract on schedule is a very important factor to facilitate the tree replanting program scheduled for the fall of 2016. Treescape clearly demonstrated their understanding of

June 7, 2016

Page 4 of 5

the scope and complexity of the 2016 Emerald Ash Borer Tree Stump Removals contract as described in the RFP.

The proposal received from ArborWorks Tree and Construction Services (ArborWorks) was ranked the highest technical submission and the third highest ranking stipulated price, resulting in an overall ranking of second. ArborWorks provided a very comprehensive and thorough submission, clearly demonstrating their understanding of the scope of work in response to the RFP. ArborWorks project schedule and project execution plan provided a clear and concise timeline with detailed approaches in meeting the required project completion date. A detailed equipment listing and key personnel listing were also provided. Detailed municipal references were provided including a project for the City of Kitchener for stump removals and restoration services. ArborWorks presented a complete proposal and demonstrated a clear understanding of the scope of the project as described in the RFP.

The proposal received from O'Brien Tree Service (O'Brien) was ranked the lowest technical submission of the proposals received. The proposal included one municipal reference but provided no detail on the scope of work which was completed. The proponent did not provide a project execution plan, which was to clearly describe the approach and methodology to be followed in completing all aspects of the work in order to achieve safe and timely completion of the project objectives. The project schedule supplied was unclear on deliverables and did not include a list of equipment which would be utilized in completing the work to the required timeline. O'Brien failed to provide a customer service standard compliance document in support of this contract or to show how they would ensure accessibility in their work sites. In evaluating the proposal, staff determined that the lack of detail in the supplied project schedule and failure to provide a project execution plan failed to describe an understanding of the project and thus provides additional risk to the City for completion of this project. The risk is associated with failure to meet the prescribed deadline to have all tree stumps removed in advance of the planned fall tree planting schedules, as well as the impact on ensuring accessibility and superior customer service. While this proposal was the lowest priced, it was ranked the lowest technical submission of the proposals received and resulted in an overall third place ranking.

As per Section C: General Terms and Conditions of the RFP for bids over \$50,000 as well as the requirements in the City's Purchasing By-Law 2000-134 as amended, when recommending a proponent other than the lowest bid, the pricing component and the ranking of all accepted submissions are reported to Council.

Proponent	Rank (using criteria in RFP)	Technical Score	Financial Score	Total Score	Bid Price Submitted (HST excluded)
Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited	1	42.5	31	73.5	\$106,508.00
ArborWorks Tree & Construction Services	2	46	25.5	71.5	\$129,797.05
O'Brien Tree Service	3	18	50	68	\$65,998.50
Timber Tree Service	4	39	23	62	\$142,996.75

Wilderness Environmental Services	5	40	19	59	\$175,089.20
Titanium Contracting Inc	6	37	18.5	55.5	\$176,081.63
Ontario Line Clearing & Tree Services 2010 Ltd	7	23.5	24	47.5	\$136,396.90

**Existing Policy/By-Law:**

By-Law 2000-134 A By-Law to establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures.

**Notice Provisions:**

Not applicable.

**Accessibility Considerations:**

Accessibility was one of the criteria used to evaluate the proposals. Treescape demonstrated a great understanding of the current accessibility legislation as well as the City's Facility accessibility design standards.

**Financial Considerations:**

The undertaking of the EAB program has budget approval as part of the Public Works multi-year capital plan.

**Contacts:**

Damon Wells, Director, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 2313

Troy Stubinski, Operations Manager, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 2183

**Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:**

Sydney Buckler, Supervisor, Public Works Department

Dan Cuthill, Capital Projects Coordinator, Engineering Department

**Exhibits Attached:**

Not applicable.