



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 16-178**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services
Resource Staff: Luke Follwell, Director, Recreation & Leisure Services
Date of Meeting: June 7, 2016
Subject: Award of Contract for Confederation Basin Marina Washroom Renovation

Executive Summary:

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award the construction contract of the Confederation Basin Marina Washroom Renovation project. Council approval is required as the proponent representing the lowest price did not have the highest scoring proposal.

It is recommended that the contract be awarded to the highest scoring proponent based on the evaluation criteria of price and qualifications.

The proposal from Emmons and Mitchell Construction (2000) Limited was not the lowest priced proposal received. Section 3.4 iii) of the Purchasing By-Law requires that approval be sought by separate report to Council when the lowest bid or proposal is not accepted.

Recommendation:

That a contract be awarded to Emmons and Mitchell Construction (2000) Limited for the 'Confederation Basin Marina Washroom Renovation' project a total price of \$448,063 plus applicable taxes; and

That the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to enter into an agreement with Emmons and Mitchell Construction (2000) Limited in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

June 7, 2016

Page 2 of 5

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Cynthia Beach, Corporate & Strategic Initiatives

Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services Not required

Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston Not required

Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer

June 7, 2016

Page 3 of 5

Options/Discussion:

On Wednesday April 20, 2016 six (6) Request for Proposals (RFP) submissions were received for RFP F31-CSG-RLS-2016-41 ‘Confederation Basin Marina Washroom Renovations’. The submissions were reviewed by staff and scored on the criteria set out in the RFP. The proposals were evaluated on price, content, experience and references, methodology, schedule and accessibility.

The lowest price was received from Allen Mechanical for \$425,000 plus tax; however, they did not demonstrate, as requested in the RFP, a thorough Risk Identification and Mitigation Plan and they did not demonstrate a robust understanding of working with the AODA as compared to other proponents. As one of the main goals of this project is to ensure that this space conforms to accessible standards and the work is completed with minimal disruption to neighboring businesses and residents, they are not recommended as the successful proponent.

Evaluation Criteria	Percentage
Proposal Content	2%
Financial Proposal	55%
Experience and References	20%
Methodology and Schedule	20%
Accessibility	3%

The second lowest price was from Emmons and Mitchel Construction (2000) Limited for \$448,063 plus tax. Emmons and Mitchell Construction (2000) Limited demonstrated excellent knowledge and experience dealing with both the AODA and more specifically, the City of Kingston’s Facility Accessibility Design Standards (FADS). As well, Emmons and Mitchell Construction were able to document a high understanding of the scope of work and requirements of this project.

The third lowest price was from David J. Cupido Construction Limited for \$459,000 plus tax. Similar to Emmons and Mitchell Construction, David J. Cupido demonstrated excellent knowledge and experience with the AODA, FADS and a high understanding of the scope of work and requirements which is reflected in these two firms being separated by 1 point.

June 7, 2016

Page 4 of 5

The results of the scoring based on the criteria listed in the RFP are indicated in the following table:

RFP Proponents	Total Score
Emmons and Mitchell Construction (2000) Limited	94
David J. Cupido Construction Limited	93
Allen Mechanical	88
Jeffrey G. Wallans Construction	87
Anglin Group Ltd	80
1610617 o/a Build All	76

Existing Policy/By-Law:

By-Law 200-134 A By-Law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures

Notice Provisions:

Not applicable

Accessibility Considerations:

Accessibility criteria have been incorporated in the evaluation criteria of the RFP and the design of the new washrooms has taken into account the Facility Accessibility Design Standards.

Financial Considerations:

The total budget for this project is \$550,000 including consulting fees, construction contingency and applicable taxes. Sufficient funds exist for these services in the current Council approved Recreation & Leisure Services Department capital budgets.

Contacts:

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services 613-546-4291 extension 1231

Luke Follwell, Director, Recreation & Leisure Services 613-546-4291 extension 1815

June 7, 2016

Page 5 of 5

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

Alan McLeod, Senior Legal Counsel, Legal Services Department

Adam McCluskey, Manager Recreation Facilities, Recreation & Leisure Services Department

Janis Morrison, Purchasing Coordinator, Financial Services Department

Exhibits Attached:

Not applicable