



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 16-201**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston
Resource Staff: Damon Wells, Director of Public Works
Date of Meeting: June 21, 2016
Subject: Award of Contract – Injection of Tree-Azin into Ash Trees

Executive Summary:

The City of Kingston developed an Emerald Ash Borer Impact Cost Mitigation Plan in 2014 to deal with the presence of the Emerald Ash Borer invasive beetle. Injection of Tree-Azin into Ash trees is just one component of the plan.

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award the Injection of Tree-Azin into Ash tree contract for the Emerald Ash Borer project. Council approval is required as staff received only two submissions for this project.

It is recommended that the contract be awarded to the highest scoring proponent based on the evaluation criteria as set out in the RFP document.

The proposal from Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited was the highest ranked and highest scored proposal received.

Section 3.4 iv) of the Purchasing By-Law requires that Council approval be sought by separate report when less than three proposals are submitted.

Recommendation:

That Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited be awarded the contract for the Injection of Tree-Azin into Ash Trees for the total price of \$ 84,953.25 plus applicable taxes; and

That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to execute a contract with Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

June 21, 2016

Page 2 of 5

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY PRESIDENT & CEO, UTILITIES KINGSTON

Jim Keech, President & CEO, Utilities Kingston

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Commissioners:

Lanie Hurdle, Community Services	Not required
Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required

June 21, 2016

Page 3 of 5

Options/Discussion:

On Wednesday June 1, 2016, two (2) Request for Proposal (RFP) submissions were received for RFP No. F31-PWS-PW-2016-19 Injection of Tree-Azin into Ash Trees. All proposals were reviewed by staff and scored on the criteria set out in the RFP. Proposals were evaluated on demonstrated relevant experience in a municipal setting, understanding of the project scope requirements, project execution, scheduling and accessibility considerations. The scope and complexity of the Injection of Tree-Azin into Ash Trees was clearly described in the RFP. The below table identifies the weightings specified in the RFP for the evaluations. The weighting for the financial component of the RFP was determined to be 60 percent and is within the range of 25 to 75 percent as prescribed within the City’s purchasing policy. Staff believes that this is an acceptable weighting for the financial component and reflects a reasonable balance between price, experience and qualifications and project execution plan described in the proposals received.

Evaluation Criteria	Weighting
Stipulated Price	60
Proponent References and Experience	15
Proposal Content	3
Project Schedule and Execution Plan	18
Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	4
Total	100

Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited (Treescape) provided a comprehensive and thorough submission in response to the RFP. Treescape provided an experienced and qualified team with certifications and training to support the project. Environmental considerations were also outlined including proper equipment refueling and disposal of pesticide containers. A detailed project schedule was supplied with milestones for deliverables by project area and a completion date, which meets the project requirements. Treescape provided three municipal contractor references including a contract with The City of Hamilton for Ash Tree Treatments with a detailed scope of work description. Treescape also provided a detailed accessible customer service standard compliance document in support of this contract to ensure accessibility in proximity to the job sites. The proposal provided by Treescape represents the best value for the City of Kingston in completing the requested services. The Treescape proposal was ranked as the best technical submission of all the proposals received, which included an execution plan and project schedule to complete the project requirements within the timeline stated in the RFP document.

The proposal received from Davey Tree Expert Co. of Canada Limited (Davey Tree) ranked second in their highest technical submission along with their pricing component, resulting in an overall ranking of second. Davey Tree provided a thorough submission, clearly demonstrating

June 21, 2016

Page 4 of 5

their understanding of the scope of work in response to the RFP. Davey Tree's project schedule and project execution plan provided a clear understanding of the timelines. A detailed equipment listing and key personnel listing were also provided. Municipal references were provided including a project for the City of London for ash tree treatments. Davey Tree presented a complete proposal and demonstrated a clear understand of the scope of the project as described in the RFP.

The table below provides final scores of the submissions from the proponents including both qualification and price.

Proponent	Rank (using criteria in RFP)	Technical Score	Financial Score	Total Score	Bid Price Submitted (HST excluded)
Treescape Tree Care Professionals Limited	1	35.5	60	95.5	\$84,953.25
Davey Resource Group	2	25.8	58.8	84.6	\$86,646.65

Existing Policy/By Law:

By-Law 2000-134 a by-Law to establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures

Notice Provisions:

Not applicable.

Accessibility Considerations:

Accessibility was one of the criteria used to evaluate the proposals. Treescape demonstrated a great understanding of the current accessibility legislation as well as the City's Facility accessibility design standards.

Financial Considerations:

The undertaking of the EAB program has budget approval as part of the Public Works multi-year capital plan.

Contacts:

Damon Wells, Director, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 2313

Troy Stubinski, Operations Manager, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 2183

June 21, 2016

Page 5 of 5

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

Sydney Buckler, Supervisor, Public Works Department

Dan Cuthill, Capital Projects Coordinator, Engineering Department

Exhibits Attached:

Not applicable.