



**City of Kingston  
Report to Council  
Report Number 16-206**

---

**To:** Mayor and Members of Council

**From:** Denis Leger, Commissioner, Transportation, Facilities and  
Emergency Services

**Resource Staff:** Speros Kanellos, Director, Facilities Management and  
Construction Services

**Date of Meeting:** June 21, 2016

**Subject:** Award of Contract for Prime Consultant for the Fleet  
Maintenance Garage

---

**Executive Summary:**

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award a contract to Architecture 49 Inc. to provide prime consultant services for the fleet maintenance garage project.

Eleven firms responded to the request for proposals. Staff evaluated the submissions and interviewed the top three proponents. Architecture 49 Inc. emerged as the top-ranked proponent however their price was not the lowest and as such, the City's Purchasing By-law 2000-134 requires that the award be approved by Council.

This report provides a general update about the project along with details of the request for proposals and the evaluation process.

**Recommendation:**

**That** Council authorize the Mayor and Clerk to enter into an agreement with Architecture 49 Inc. to provide prime consultant services for the fleet maintenance garage project and that the agreement be in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

June 21, 2016

Page 2 of 7

**Authorizing Signatures:**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER

**Denis Leger, Commissioner, Transportation,  
Facilities and Emergency Services**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

**Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer**

**Consultation with the following members of the Corporate Management Team:**

Lanie Hurdle, Community Services	Not required
Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required

June 21, 2016

Page 3 of 7

**Options/Discussion:****Background:**

The Fleet Services Division of the Transportation Services Department maintains the City's fleet of vehicles including snow plows, garbage and recycling trucks, forestry trucks, street sweepers, pick-up trucks, vans and cars at the Division Street Public Works Yard. The existing fleet maintenance garage was built in the 1940's. It is outdated and in poor condition and needs to be replaced with a better-equipped and more suitable facility.

The site at 701 Division Street currently houses the Public Works Operations Centre, the existing fleet maintenance garage, trades shops, a sand and salt dome, the former Friendship Construction office building, the Railway Street Fire Station and a Kingston Hydro substation. The Kingston Police Headquarters is adjacent to the site at 705 Division Street. Exhibit A shows the property and existing buildings.

The site is a brownfield; the soil and groundwater have been impacted by past land uses and historical practices. Dealing with soil stockpiles from previous excavations and minimizing off-site soil disposal will be essential in order to contain costs. The site also presents challenges due to topography, access points, storm water management concerns and geotechnical conditions. The Facilities Management and Construction Services (FMCS) department has commissioned a series of site investigations and engineering feasibility studies to ensure that there are viable, cost-effective solutions to the development of the site.

The long-term development plan for the site includes the new fleet maintenance facility, a vehicle storage garage and a new sand/salt building. After extensive studies of various options, the most suitable location has been determined for the new fleet maintenance garage on the same site. The proposed acquisition of additional lands from Weston's allows for the building to be constructed in a location that minimizes the need for contaminated soil removal and reduces the scale of costly foundation work. The plan is to keep the existing garage for use as a vehicle storage building until the new storage garage is built. The conceptual site plan is attached as Exhibit B.

With these studies in hand, the next step is to hire a qualified prime consultant to provide architectural, civil, structural, mechanical and electrical engineering services including coordination, design, preparation of working drawings and specifications, general review and contract administration.

The primary goal of this project is to provide the Fleet Services Division with a functional and durable new maintenance garage while retaining development options for the site to accommodate the long-term needs of Public Works. As a secondary goal, FMCS would like to use this project as an opportunity to explore and potentially demonstrate the City's commitment to reducing its greenhouse gas emissions. One of the first tasks of the prime consultant team will be to study the feasibility of incorporating a co-generation (combined heat and power) or tri-generation (heat, power and cooling) plant into the campus as well as using on-site renewable energy generation to offset and reduce carbon emissions. Where the studies demonstrate life-

June 21, 2016

Page 4 of 7

cycle cost and/or environmental benefits, these options will be presented to Council for consideration. The project will target LEED certification at a silver level or higher.

**Budget:**

The 2014/15 capital budget included \$5.0 M for preliminary work on the project. An additional \$15.0 M had been identified as a 2017 expenditure in the City's 15-year capital forecast as a placeholder. This was an order-of-magnitude estimate based on the size and scope of the project. The latest estimate based on the proposed design concept is approximately \$24.0 M including soft costs and contingencies but not including renewable energy generation systems or a co-generation system. One of the first tasks of the prime consultant will be to provide design information to the City's cost consultant for a class D estimate. FMCS plans to have the design and feasibility studies sufficiently advanced by the fall of 2016 to present Council with a revised 2017 capital budget request.

**Schedule:**

The plan is to do the construction work in phases; the site work would take place in the spring and summer of 2017 followed by the building construction in 2017-18.

**Request for Proposals:**

The Facilities Management and Construction Services (FMCS) department issued a request for proposals in March for prime consultant services for the project, which includes the new fleet maintenance garage at the Division Street municipal campus and associated site servicing. The prime consultant services include architectural and engineering design, production of working drawings and specifications, assistance in procuring construction services, site review and contract administration during construction. The services also include engineering studies to determine the feasibility of incorporating on-site renewable energy generation and/or a co-generation or tri-generation plant into the project. If the studies demonstrate environmental and/or financial benefits and the City should decide to proceed with these options, FMCS will negotiate additional fees with the prime consultant and expand their scope of work accordingly.

The Request for Proposals (RFP) outlined the City's need for an architectural and engineering team with experience in the design of vehicle maintenance garages but also with demonstrated strength in the areas of site servicing, municipal infrastructure, sustainable design, renewable energy generation and co-generation facilities.

In accordance with the City's Purchasing By-Law, RFP F31-TFES-FMCS-2016-05 was publicly advertised on Biddingo. The RFP closed on April 27, 2016. Eleven submissions were received.

**Evaluation of Submissions**

The RFP established an evaluation framework as follows:

June 21, 2016

Page 5 of 7

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Points</b>
Fee Proposal	35
Experience and references	27
Methodology	30
Company Profile	5
Accessibility	3
<b>Total</b>	<b>100</b>

The fee proposal format included a breakdown by project component and phase, with fixed fees for the site servicing, driveway, renewable energy study and co-generation study, and a percentage-of-construction based fee for the garage. For evaluation purposes the percentage fee was multiplied by the most recent order-of-magnitude cost estimate of \$13,700,000 for the garage, and then this was added to the fixed fees for the other components. Proponents were given extensive information on which to base their fixed fees for the civil engineering work including all of the site information and engineering studies available to date and the preliminary site servicing cost estimates (\$2,600,000 for site servicing and \$900,000 for the driveway). The submissions were reviewed and evaluated in detail by the Manager of Fleet Services, the Director of Facilities Management & Construction Services (FMCS), the Project Manager, FMCS and the Project Assistant, FMCS. The evaluation team interviewed the three highest ranked proponents and checked references for the recommended proponent.

The following table summarizes the results of the evaluation:

<b>Firm</b>	<b>Rank</b>	<b>Points</b>	<b>Fee</b>	<b>Disbursements</b>
Architecture 49 Inc.	1	89.16	\$745,170	\$8,250
Barry Bryan Associates	2	85.71	\$856,900	\$39,800
Shoalts and Zaback Architects Ltd.	3	85.00	\$727,300	\$43,000

June 21, 2016

Page 6 of 7

Stantec/Colbourne & Kembel	4	84.13	\$993,308	\$33,500
J.L. Richards & Associates Limited	5	78.75	\$1,256,900	\$65,000
Norr Limited	6	78.14	\$992,770	\$25,350
AECOM	7	73.43	\$927,945	\$5,500
CSV Architects	8	68.92	\$785,140	\$7,500
RAW Design	9	67.58	\$736,095	\$16,000
Dreesen Cardinal Architects Inc.	10	65.42	\$1,021,450	\$10,700
IBI Group	11	54.21	\$1,790,900	\$6,400

While all of the higher-ranked proponents presented strong proposals and well-qualified teams, each had their strengths and weaknesses. After careful evaluation, interviews and reference checks the evaluation team is confident that Architecture 49 Inc. presents the best combination of experience, qualifications, methodology and price. Their fee is only marginally higher than the lowest fee submitted. They demonstrated considerable experience and expertise in fleet maintenance garage design and are well qualified to undertake all of the other aspects of the project. The architectural firm is partnered with WSP, a full-service engineering firm. The evaluation team considers this an advantage over some of the other proponents who brought in separate firms for civil, structural, mechanical and electrical engineering. Coordination between sub-consultants can be a major challenge on complex projects and is facilitated when the majority of the disciplines are in-house.

The second-ranked proponent, Barry Bryan Associates had some experience in the design of maintenance garages but not to the same extent as Architecture 49. Their fee was also significantly higher. Their team included five sub-consultant firms to provide mechanical engineering, electrical engineering, co-gen engineering, civil engineering and landscape architecture. While all of the sub-consultants had the requisite qualifications, the evaluation team was concerned about the difficulties of coordination amongst so many firms.

The third-ranked proponent, Shoalts and Zaback Architects, had the lowest fee (not including disbursements) but did not score as well as the other two on the technical criteria. They did not present the same level of experience in fleet maintenance garage design.

June 21, 2016

Page 7 of 7

The fourth and fifth ranked proponents both scored highly on the technical criteria but had significantly higher fees.

Purchasing By-Law No. 2000-134, Section 3.4, requires that Council authorize an award of contract if the provisions of delegation of authority to staff are not met. As staff is recommending award to the highest ranked submission which is not the lowest cost proposal, Council approval is required.

**Existing Policy/By-Law:**

By-Law 2000-134, "A By-Law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures for the City of Kingston", as amended.

**Notice Provisions:**

There are no notice requirements for this report.

**Accessibility Considerations:**

The *Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, 2005* is a consideration and forms part of the evaluation criteria of all Requests for Proposals administered by the City of Kingston.

**Financial Considerations:**

There are sufficient funds available in the approved 2016 capital budget to proceed with the award of a contract for prime consultant services as recommended in this report.

**Contacts:**

Speros Kanellos, Director, FMCS, 613-546-4291 ext. 3133  
Debra Krakow, Project Manager, FMCS, 613-546-4291 ext. 3120

**Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:**

Alan McLeod, Senior Legal Counsel  
Bud Steele, Manager, Fleet Services  
Janis Morrison, Purchasing Coordinator, Financial Services

**Exhibits Attached:**

Exhibit A – Existing Site Plan

Exhibit B – Conceptual Site Plan





**EXHIBIT B- CONCEPT SITE PLAN A - BUILDING LOCATIONS**  
 701 DIVISION STREET - FLEET MAINTENANCE GARAGE