



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 17-149**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services
Resource Staff: Luke Follwell, Director, Recreation & Leisure Services
Date of Meeting: May 16, 2017
Subject: Award of Contract - Construction Services of Breakwater Park

Executive Summary:

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award the contract for the construction services of Breakwater Park.

It is recommended that the contract be awarded to Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd., the highest scoring proponent, based on the evaluation criteria as set out in the Request for Proposals.

The proposal submitted by Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd. was not the lowest priced proposal received. Section 3.4 iii) of the Purchasing By-Law requires that approval be sought by separate report to Council when the lowest bid or proposal is not accepted.

Recommendation:

That Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd. be awarded the contract for the 'Construction Services of Breakwater Park' project, RFP F31-CSG-RLS-2017-21 'Construction Services for Breakwater Park', for a total price of \$2,749,159 plus applicable taxes; and

That the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to enter into an agreement with Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd. in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

May 16, 2017

Page 2 of 5

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Denis Leger, Commissioner, Corporate & Emergency Services

√

Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston

Not required

Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer

Not required

May 16, 2017

Page 3 of 5

Options/Discussion:

On Wednesday, April 19, 2017, seven (7) Request for Proposal (RFP) submissions were received for RFP F31-CSG-RLS-2017-21 'Construction Services for Breakwater Park'. The submissions were reviewed by staff and scored on the criteria set out in the RFP. The proposals were evaluated on price, schedule and methodology, references and experience, accessibility and content. Shortlisted proponents were interviewed as part of the selection process, based on the criteria in the RFP.

Evaluation Criteria	Weighting
Financial Proposal	65%
Schedule and Methodology	18%
References and Experience	12%
Accessibility	3%
Proposal Content	2%

The lowest price received was from Orin Contractors. As part of the RFP evaluation process, staff met with Orin Contractors to review and seek clarification regarding their proposal completeness and content. They did not demonstrate a thorough understanding of how they would execute the project, particularly as it pertained to shoreline and in-water works which will be permitted through outside authorizing agencies. Timing and sequencing of the various elements of the project were unclear, and a distinct ability to achieving the completion date, which has been stipulated by the City's funding partners, was not demonstrated.

The second lowest price was submitted by the firm Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd. Staff also met with this proponent, and several of their subcontractors, to review and provide clarification of their proposal. Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd. and their multidisciplinary project team demonstrated excellent knowledge and experience dealing with many of the elements of this complex project. Their experience, creative approach to the project and project solving abilities were evident in their proposal and were further demonstrated in their meeting with staff. They were able to demonstrate a great understanding of the scope of work and requirements of this project, including the construction timeline and a clear understanding of the completion goal.

Through their proposal, the third ranked firm, Emmons and Mitchell Construction Limited, demonstrated a good knowledge of the project requirements and their project team had experience on similar projects. The cost component of their score contributed to their final rank.

May 16, 2017

Page 4 of 5

The results of the scoring based on the criteria listed in the RFP are indicated in the following table:

RFP Proponents	Price	Total Score
Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd.	\$2,749,159.00	82
Orin Contractors Corp.	\$2,472,676.50	78
Emmons and Mitchell Construction Limited	\$3,104,575.62	75
Len Corcoran Excavating Ltd.	\$3,806,046.65	72
CSL Group	\$3,267,289.35	66
Thomas Fuller Construction Co. Limited	\$3,953,603.84	65
Cruickshank Construction	\$4,810,887.55	54

Existing Policy/By-Law:

By-Law 200-134 A By-Law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures

Notice Provisions:

Not applicable

Accessibility Considerations:

Accessibility criteria have been incorporated in the evaluation criteria of the RFP and the design of the park improvements has taken into account the Facility Accessibility Design Standards.

Financial Considerations:

The submission from Buddy Haegele Enterprises Ltd. is within the approved budget for this project including consideration of construction contingency, consulting fees, permits, administration and applicable taxes. Sufficient funds exist for these services in the current Council approved Recreation & Leisure Services Department capital budgets.

May 16, 2017

Page 5 of 5

Contacts:

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services 613-546-4291 extension 1231

Luke Follwell, Director, Recreation & Leisure Services 613-546-4291 extension 1815

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

Alan McLeod, Senior Legal Counsel, Legal Services Department

Neal Unsworth, Manager, Parks Development, Recreation & Leisure Services Department

Exhibits Attached:

Not applicable