



CITY OF KINGSTON
REPORT TO COUNCIL

Report No.: 12-237

TO: Mayor and Members of Council
FROM: Denis Leger, Commissioner of Transportation, Properties & Emergency Services
RESOURCE STAFF: Sheila Kidd, Director of Transportation Services
Robert (Bud) Steele, Manager of Fleet
DATE OF MEETING: July 17, 2012
SUBJECT: F31-TPES-TS-FL-2012-21– Three (3) Ice-Resurfacing Machines

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award an RFP for the purchase of three ice-resurfacing machines to Zamboni Company Limited. Council approval is required, as staff is not recommending the lowest bid submission.

RECOMMENDATION:

THAT the RFP F31-TPES-TS-FL-2012-21 for the purchase of three ice-resurfacing machines be awarded to Zamboni Company Limited for the total purchase price of \$233,967 plus applicable taxes for all three units.

AUTHORIZING SIGNATURES:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER
Denis Leger, Commissioner of Transportation, Properties & Emergency Services

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

CONSULTATION WITH THE FOLLOWING COMMISSIONERS:

Cynthia Beach, <i>Sustainability & Growth</i>	N/R
Lanie Hurdle, <i>Community Services</i>	√
Jim Keech, <i>President and CEO, Utilities Kingston</i>	N/R

July 17, 2012

- Page 2 -

OPTIONS/DISCUSSION:

The Fleet Services Division issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) on behalf of the Recreation and Leisure Services Department for the purchase of three ice-resurfacing machines. These units are to replace existing equipment that has fulfilled lifecycle requirements.

The response to the RFP is as follows:

Vendor	Rank	Purchase Price (excluding applicable tax)
Zamboni Company Ltd.	1	\$233,967
Resurface Corporation	2	\$225,075

Comparisons between the two units were reviewed by staff using the following criteria:

- Purchase price
- Fuel economy and greenhouse gas emissions
- Ergonomics, driver comfort, and ease of use
- Delivery
- Warranty

When staff reviewed the proposals, the above-noted criteria was considered which included company profile as well as the ability to provide parts, service and warranty representation for the proposed product. This RFP took into consideration all aspects of the Green Fleet Policy.

Two manufacturers are the primary competitors in this class of machinery: Resurface Corporation that produces the Olympia machine and the Zamboni Company that produces their machine bearing the same name. Both machines are capable and well supported regarding servicing, parts supply, and warranty.

The build platforms of the two machines are quite different. The Zamboni machine is purpose-built from the frame up, while the Resurface unit uses a GMC four-wheel drive truck platform as their foundation.

The Zamboni unit uses a four-cylinder 65-horsepower engine and propels the machine through hydrostatics, which is essentially a hydraulic pump driven by the engine that supplies motive power to the wheels. The Resurface option uses an eight-cylinder motor producing 120-horsepower driving the wheels through a conventional automatic transmission. Both units are four-wheel drives.

July 17, 2012

- Page 3 -

The hydrostatic propulsion system is able to utilize a smaller engine to drive the hydraulics. The engine is run at a constant speed during resurfacing operations. This generally results in better hydraulic system function and greater fuel efficiency. Fuel consumption figures were requested within the RFP document.

The source of fuel for both products is propane. The Zamboni uses a 33lb tank of fuel in a three and a half hour period compared to the Olympia that uses 33lbs of fuel in two hours. The current cost of 33lb tank of propane is \$72. This class of machine has a minimum lifecycle of 5000 hours. Using those figures against the lifecycle projection of the machine equates to the following overall cost of fuel:

Zamboni Company Ltd.	\$102,857
Resurface Corporation	\$180,000

The City presently owns and operates ice-resurfacing machines from both manufacturers. In addition to the scoring criteria, Fleet Services conducted a maintenance data audit comparing the two machines on a cost per hour basis. Ice machines from both companies with the closest amount of in-service hours were used in the comparison. Two Olympia machines were used. One machine has 3800 hours of in-service use and the other having 3900 hours. The average cost per hour of maintenance to date is \$16.35 per hour of operation. The Zamboni machines had 3600 hours and 2900 hours respectively. The average cost of maintenance for those units to date is \$4.78 per operating hour.

This compilation further reinforces staff's recommendation to the Zamboni Company proposal.

EXISTING POLICY/BY LAW:

By-law 2000-134, *a By-law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures for the City of Kingston*

Green Fleet Policy for the City of Kingston

NOTICE PROVISIONS:

N/A

ACCESSIBILITY CONSIDERATIONS:

Consideration of the *Ontarians with Disabilities Act* is incorporated into every City issued RFP.

July 17, 2012

- Page 4 -

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS:

This purchase is funded from the Recreation Facilities 2011/2012 capital budgets as approved by Council.

CONTACTS:

Sheila Kidd, Director of Transportation Service
Robert (Bud) Steele, Manager of Fleet

613-546-4291, Ext. 2221
613-546-4291, Ext. 2216

OTHER CITY OF KINGSTON STAFF CONSULTED:

Luke Follwell , Manager, Recreation Facilities

613-546-4291, Ext. 1815

EXHIBITS ATTACHED:

N/A