



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 18-096**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston
Resource Staff: Sheila Kidd, Deputy Commissioner Operations - Transportation & Infrastructure Services
Date of Meeting: March 20, 2018
Subject: Award of Contract – 2018 Tree Order

Executive Summary:

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award the City's 2018 tree order contract for the annual tree planting program and the emerald ash borer tree replacement project. Council approval is required as staff received only two submissions for this project.

It is recommended that the contract be awarded to the highest scoring proponent based on the evaluation criteria set out in the RFP document. The proposal from Dutchmaster Nurseries Limited scored the highest in the evaluation process.

Section 3.4 iv) of the Purchasing By-Law requires that approval be sought by separate report to Council when the only two proposals are submitted.

Recommendation:

That Council authorize the Mayor and Clerk to enter into a contract with Dutchmaster Nurseries Limited, in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services, for the 2018 tree order at a total price of \$328,725 plus applicable taxes.

March 20, 2018

Page 2 of 4

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY PRESIDENT & CEO, UTILITIES KINGSTON

Jim Keech, President & CEO, Utilities Kingston

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required
Denis Leger, Commissioner Corporate & Emergency Services	Not required

March 20, 2018

Page 3 of 4

Options/Discussion:

On Wednesday, February 28, 2018, two Request for Proposal (RFP) submissions were received for RFP No. F31-TIS-PW-2018-06 2018 Tree Order. All proposals were reviewed by staff and scored on the criteria set out in the RFP. Proposals were evaluated on proposed methodology and understanding of the project scope requirements, company profile, and accessibility considerations. The scope and complexity for the tree-planting program was clearly described in the RFP. The table below identifies the weightings specified in the RFP for the evaluations.

The weighting for the financial component of the RFP was determined to be 75% and it is within the range of 25% to 75% as prescribed within the City’s purchasing policy. Staff believes that this is an acceptable weighting for the financial component and reflects a reasonable balance between price, methodology and qualifications, and accessibility as described in the proposals received.

Evaluation Criteria	Weighting
Stipulated Price	75
Proposed Methodology	12
Company Profile	10
Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	3
Total	100

Dutchmaster Nurseries Limited (Dutchmaster) provided a complete submission in response to the RFP. Dutchmaster provided a qualified team to support this project. Dutchmaster provided three references that included a contract with City of Oshawa for the supply of deciduous trees. Dutchmaster has supplied the City of Kingston for the annual tree-planting program for the last five plus years. The proposal provided by Dutchmaster represents the best value for the City of Kingston. Dutchmaster’s proposal was ranked as the highest ranked submission received.

The proposal submitted by Uxbridge Nurseries Limited (Uxbridge), demonstrated a good understanding of the project. References and experience were provided that represented similar past projects. Their cost was higher than the lowest bid, therefore resulting in a second place ranking.

The table below provides final scores of the submissions from the proponents including both qualification and price.

Proponent	Rank (using criteria in RFP)	Total Score	Bid Price Submitted (HST excluded)
Dutchmaster Nursery Limited	1	96.5	\$328,725
Uxbridge Nurseries Limited	2	78.7	\$381,305

March 20, 2018

Page 4 of 4

Existing Policy/By Law:

By-Law 2000-134, a By-law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures.

Notice Provisions:

Not applicable.

Accessibility Considerations:

Accessibility was one of the criteria used to evaluate the proposals. Dutchmaster demonstrated a good understanding of the current accessibility legislation.

Financial Considerations:

The undertaking of the Tree Planting Program has budget approval as part of the Public Works multi-year capital plan.

Contacts:

Damon Wells, Director, Public Works Department, Ext. 2313

Troy Stubinski, Operations Manager, Public Works Department, Ext. 2183

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

Dan Cuthill, Capital Projects Coordinator, Engineering Department

Exhibits Attached:

Not applicable.