City of Kingston  
Report to Heritage Kingston  
Report Number HK-20-016

To: Chair and Members of Heritage Kingston  
From: Paige Agnew, Commissioner, Community Services  
Resource Staff: Same as above  
Date of Meeting: March 18, 2020  
Subject: Application for Heritage Permit under the *Ontario Heritage Act*  
Address: 235 Frontenac Street (P18-(1404))  
File Number: P18-004-2020

Council Strategic Plan Alignment:

Theme: Corporate business  
Goal: See above

Executive Summary:

The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* in 2018.

An application for removal under Section 34 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (File Number P18-004-2020) has been submitted to permit the removal of four (4) portable classrooms from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are to be relocated to another school property. They are not noted as heritage attributes in the designating by-law.

This application was deemed complete on February 11, 2020. The *Ontario Heritage Act* provides a maximum of 90 days for Council to render a decision on an application to alter a heritage building under Section 34(2). This timeframe will expire on May 11, 2020.

Upon review of all the submitted materials, as well as applicable policies and legislation, staff recommend approval of the proposed scope of work, subject to the conditions outlined herein.
Recommendation:

That Heritage Kingston recommends to Council:

That the removal of the four portable classroom buildings at 235 Frontenac Street, be approved in accordance with the details described in the application (File Number P18-004-2020), which was deemed complete on February 11, 2020; and

That the approval of the removal be subject to the following conditions:

1. A Demolition/Building Permit shall be obtained, as required; and
2. A Utilities Kingston Service Removal approval shall be obtained.
Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER
Paige Agnew, Commissioner,
Community Services

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER
Lanie Hurdle, Chief
Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Peter Huigenbos, Commissioner, Business, Environment & Projects Not required
Brad Joyce, Acting Commissioner, Corporate Services Not required
Jim Keech, President & CEO, Utilities Kingston Not required
Desirée Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer Not required
Sheila Kidd, Commissioner, Transportation & Public Works Not required
Options/Discussion:

Description of the Application

The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the north half of the city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets (Exhibit A – Context Map & Photographs). The property includes the buildings associated with Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI) and Module Vanier and is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Exhibit B – Designating By-Law Number 2017-217).

An application for alteration under Section 34 of the Ontario Heritage Act (File Number P18-004-2020) has been submitted to permit the removal of four (4) portable classrooms from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The single storey metal clad portable classrooms are each approximately 20 years old. Three (3) of the portables were moved to the subject property to accommodate the temporary increase in the student population, following the closure of Queen Elizabeth Collegiate and Vocational Institute, in 2017. The southernmost portable (noted as #1 on Exhibit C - Concept Plans) was moved to the site in 2019. The portables are to be relocated to other schools in the Limestone District School Board.

All submission materials are available online through the Development and Services Hub (DASH) at the following link, DASH, using “Look-up a Specific Address”. If there are multiple addresses, search one address at a time, or submission materials may also be found by searching the file number.

This application was deemed complete on February 11, 2020. The Ontario Heritage Act provides a maximum of 90 days for Council to render a decision on an application to alter a heritage building under Section 34(2). This timeframe will expire on May 11, 2020.

Reasons for Designation

The subject property was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018 through By-Law Number 2017-217 (Exhibit B). The property, known locally as KCVI, represents the history and inception of secondary school education in Ontario. KCVI can trace its roots back to 1786 when it was originally established by The Reverend John Stuart as the first secondary school in Ontario. The earliest of the current buildings date from 1911 with additions added in 1931, 1959 and 1968. KCVI has further associative value with well-known local architects Joseph Power and Colin Drever. KCVI has a long list of influential alumni such as former members of federal and provincial parliament, former City of Kingston mayors, as well as members of the Kingston rock band, The Tragically Hip. The full statement of significance is included in Designating By-Law Number 2017-217 attached as Exhibit B as well as the following heritage attributes:

- The building’s scale and massing and visual presence on Frontenac and Alfred Streets, including the Alfred Street 1911 section and the Frontenac Street 1931 and 1959 sections.

The four recently added portable classroom buildings are not noted as heritage attributes.
Cultural Heritage Analysis
The subject property is an important evolved cultural heritage resource that provides one a glimpse into the history of secondary school education in Ontario. It also has direct ties with many important local persons.

Under Section 34 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the demolition of any building or structure on a designated (Part IV) heritage property requires approval from the municipality with review by its heritage committee. The four (4) portable classrooms were brought to the site for a specific purpose. They are not considered part of the cultural heritage value of the subject property. Their removal will allow better views of the east side of the building; portions of which are the oldest part of the complex and a heritage attribute of the property.

The subject property is an important heritage property in the City. The proposed removals will improve the public’s view of the heritage resources on-site thus conserving and providing a positive impact to the cultural heritage value of this property. Heritage Planning staff are of the opinion that the proposal will uphold the heritage conservation objectives set out within the City of Kingston’s Official Plan, the Ministry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries’ Eight Guiding Principles in the Conservation of Built Heritage Properties, and Parks Canada’s Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada.

Previous Approvals
P18-138-2018DA Masonry repointing on south elevation

Comments from Departments and Agencies
This application was circulated to a number of internal departments who provided the following comments:

Building: A Building Permit will be required for the removal of the portables.

Kingston Hydro: The applicant will need to contact a services advisor at Utilities Kingston for a Services Removal request form for removal of the electric service prior to removal of the portable(s).

Consultation with Heritage Kingston
Heritage Kingston was consulted on this application through the Development and Services Hub (DASH) system. The Committee’s comments have been compiled and attached as Exhibit D. No concerns were expressed from responding members.

Existing Policy/By-Law:

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (Parks Canada)
City of Kingston Official Plan
By-Law Number 2017-217– Designating By-Laws for 235 Frontenac Street
Notice Provisions:

Pursuant to Section 34(2) of the *Ontario Heritage Act (OHA)*, notice of receipt of a complete application has been served on the applicant. As per Section 34(2) of the *OHA*, notice of the decision must be served on the property owner, the Ontario Heritage Trust and published in a local newspaper.

Accessibility Considerations:

None

Financial Considerations:

None

Contacts:

Andrea Gummo, Acting Manager, Policy Planning 613-546-4291 extension 3256

Ryan Leary, Senior Planner, Heritage 613-546-4291 extension 3233

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

The application was circulated to a number of internal departments for review and all comments have been incorporated.

Exhibits Attached:

Exhibit A  Context Map & Photographs
Exhibit B  Designating By-Law Number 2017-217
Exhibit C  Concept Plans, Prepared by the Applicant
Exhibit D  Correspondence Received from Heritage Kingston
Portable classrooms to be removed
Portable Classrooms to be removed

View looking west
By-Law Number 2017-217

A By-Law to Designate the Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute at 235 Frontenac Street and 136 Alfred Street to be of Cultural Heritage Value and Interest pursuant to the Provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act (R.S.O. 1990, 0.18)

Passed: January 9, 2018

Whereas Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Chapter 0.18 authorizes the Council of a Municipality to enact by-laws to designate real property, including all buildings and structures thereon, to be of cultural heritage value or interest; and

Whereas Council has consulted with its Municipal Heritage Committee and has approved the designation of the property located at 235 Frontenac Street and 136 Alfred Street, also known as the Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (Lots 903-910, Plan A12, City of Kingston, County of Frontenac and Lots 911-912, 939-940, 945-946, Plan A 12, Except Part 1 on Reference Plan 13R-11181; City of Kingston, County of Frontenac) on October 4, 2017; and

Whereas a notice of intention to designate the property was published in The Kingston Whig-Standard, which is a newspaper having general circulation in the municipality, on November 21, 2017; and

Whereas no notice of objection to the proposed designation was served to the Clerk of the Corporation of the City of Kingston.

Therefore be it resolved that the Council of The Corporation of the City of Kingston hereby enacts as follows:

1. To designate as being of cultural heritage value and interest the following property in the City of Kingston: 235 Frontenac Street and 136 Alfred Street, also known as the Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute, more particularly described in Schedule "A" attached hereto and forming part of this by-law;

2. A copy of the designating by-law shall be registered against the property affected in the proper land registry office. The City Clerk is hereby authorized to cause a copy of this by-law to be served on the owner (Limestone District School Board) of the land described in Schedule "A" hereto and on The Ontario Heritage Trust and to cause notice of the passing of this by-law to be published in The Kingston Whig-Standard;

3. For the purpose of interpretation the term 'Maintenance' will include the following:

"Maintenance means routine, cyclical, non-destructive actions, necessary to slow the deterioration of a Protected Heritage Properties, including the following:
periodic inspection; property cleanup; gardening and repair of landscape features; replacement of glass in broken windows; minor exterior repairs, including replacement of individual asphalt shingles where there is little or no change in colour or design; repainting where there is little or no change in colour; re-pointing areas of wall space under 1.5 square metres in accordance with the City's Policy of Masonry Restoration on Heritage Buildings; caulking and weatherproofing."

4. The City reserves the right to install a designated property plaque or interpretive panel; and

5. This by-law shall come into force and take effect on the date of its passing.

Given First and Second Readings: November 7, 2017
Given Third Reading and Passed January 9, 2018

Janet Jaynes
Acting City Clerk

Bryan Paterson
Mayor
Schedule “A”

Description and Reasons for Designation

Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI)

Civic Address: 235 Frontenac Street and 136 Alfred Street

Legal Description: Lots 903-910, Plan A12, City of Kingston, County of Frontenac; and Lots 911-912, 939-940, 945-946, Plan A 12, Except Part 1 on Reference Plan 13R-11181; City of Kingston, County of Frontenac.

Tax Roll Number: 1011010070104000000

Introduction and Description of Property

Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute, known locally as KCVI, (Plan A12, Lots 903 to 912 inclusive and Part of Lots 939 and 945, City of Kingston) is located south of Earl Street between Frontenac Street to the west and Alfred Street to the east; immediately adjacent to Queens University main campus to the south. The property is approximately 1.2 hectares (3 acres) with frontage onto Frontenac, Earl and Alfred Streets.

The oldest section of the current brick and limestone building (the Alfred Street elevation) was constructed in 1911. The three-storey Frontenac Street addition was constructed in two stages starting at the southern end in 1931 and adding on to the north in 1959. In 1959 the earlier school building, dating from 1892 and designed by well-known local architecture firm Powers & Son, was demolished. This property has cultural heritage value through its physical/design values, its historical associations, and its contextual values.

The style of this building can be seen in secondary school architecture of this period across southern Ontario. It is similar in many ways to Jarvis Collegiate in Toronto, built in 1824.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

Physical/Design Value

The property has physical/design value particularly in its 1911, 1931 and 1959 sections. The first two storeys of the 9 bay brick façade with limestone foundation, located closest to Alfred Street, was built in 1911, making it the oldest surviving portion of the building. The third floor addition was added in 1959. 18 large multi-pane windows with thick muntins grace the first and second floors of the east wall; the first floor with rounded heads and the second floor with square heads. This window pattern is continued on the south wall; while the openings and sills remain, the windows have been removed and bricked.

Brick pilasters separate the bays on the east wall, while a deep cornice with delicate dentils separate the older portion of the building from the upper floor addition, and adds to its physical design value.
The 11 vertical bays along Frontenac Street were built in two stages starting in 1931. The northern four (4) bays were added in 1959. The building is three storeys high consisting of a limestone foundation and brick cladding and includes nine (9) large multi-pane windows in 9 of its 11 vertical bays (the entrance bays being the exception). The brick clad walls are capped by limestone coping, broken regularly by limestone scuppers and its consistent fenestration pattern of multi-pane casement windows, are of particular heritage value.

Further elements reflecting its physical/design value include the two Collegiate Gothic or Beaux-Arts Gothic style projecting limestone entranceways with glazed oak doors in the 1931 section, facing Frontenac Street. Rising above the main entrance on Frontenac Street are two sets of tripartite windows on both the second and third floors. A large sign reading “Kingston Collegiate Vocational Institute” stands above the third floor window on the parapet wall over the main entrance.

The smaller of the two entrances includes the same large windows on the second and third floors above the main entrance, without the narrow flanking windows. A pair of original cast iron sconces is still extant on either side of this entrance. The rear façade of the 1931 portion of the building, which mirrors that of the front façade, is highly visible from Alfred Street.

Historical/Associative Value

The historical and associative value of this property begins with the school’s founding. The Reverend John Stuart was a United Empire Loyalist and Anglican Missionary who in 1786 opened his first school out of his home near the present day Kingston General Hospital. In 1792 Lieutenant-Governor John Graves Simcoe authorized a grant to The Reverend Stuart in order for him to operate a grammar school.

Known as the “Midland District School”, the first stand-alone grammar school was located in a log and frame building near the present intersection of King Street East and Lower Union Street. In 1853 it moved to Clergy Street into what is now Sydenham Public School. The school was renamed the Kingston Collegiate Institute in 1872.

In 1892 it moved to its current site and into a new Romanesque Revival style building facing Earl Street, designed by well-known Kingston Architect Joseph Power of Power & Son. The new building cost $32,000 to build and school paid an extra $500 for terracotta ornamentation of the exterior.

Additions were added to the building along Alfred Street in 1911 (presumably also designed by Power & Son). In 1931 the large wing along Frontenac Street was added for a new gymnasium and auditorium. It was designed by local architect Colin Drever of Drever & Smith architects in the Collegiate Gothic or Beaux-Arts Gothic style, with aspects of Art Deco. The school was renamed Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute in 1932.
In 1959 the original 1892 structure was demolished because it had fallen into disrepair. The northern four bays were added along Frontenac Street in a similar style to the 1931 wing and likely also designed by Drever. Also the third floor was added onto the 1911 Alfred Street wing at that time.

A further renovation and addition was undertaken in 1968 along Earl Street, in order to add a new gymnasium and auto shop.

The Reverend Stuart's grammar school, which evolved into what is now KCVI, is recognized as the first secondary school in Ontario, the second being Jarvis Collegiate in Toronto founded by Stuart's son George O'Keeffe Stuart.

The property has historical value for its contribution to the understanding of the evolution of the educational system in Kingston and the Province. It provides a direct link to the creation of post elementary / secondary school education in Ontario.

Throughout its long history many persons of national and provincial distinction have had connections to the school, including: Sir John A. Macdonald, Prime Minister of Canada; Sir Oliver Mowat, Premier of Ontario; and George Kirkpatrick, Lieutenant-Governor of Ontario, who laid the 1892 commemorative stone (later removed).

Throughout the war years KCVI played a vital role, offering night courses to the military. Among KCVI's artifacts are two historic plaques honouring students who gave their lives in the First and Second World Wars.

On November 12, 1992, a new coat of arms was dedicated by His Excellency The Right Honourable Ramon A. Hnatyshyn, Governor General of Canada, on the occasion of the Bicentennial of Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute.

Graduates of KCVI include many well-known local political figures, such as:
- The Honourable Peter Milliken, Speaker of the House of Commons and former M.P. for Kingston and the Islands;
- Ted Hsu, M.P. for Kingston and the Islands;
- Ken Keyes, former M.P.P. for Kingston and the Islands; and
- Former City of Kingston Mayors: Ken Matthews, Helen Cooper, Val Swain, George Speal and William (Bill) Mills.

The members of the well-known Kingston rock band The Tragically Hip and rock soloist David Usher are also graduates of KCVI.

Contextual Value

This property has contextual value for its importance in maintaining and supporting the institutional character of this area. This large prominent building provides a physical and functional link to the long standing institutional history of this part of Kingston.
Cultural Heritage Attributes
The heritage attributes essential to the cultural heritage value and interest of this property include:

- The building's scale and massing and visual presence on Frontenac and Alfred Streets;
- Foundation date stone on the west wall (Frontenac Street), which reads "Erected 1931";
- Alfred Street 1911 section:
  - The two-storey 9 vertical-bay brick façade with limestone foundation;
  - The consistent fenestration pattern on the first and second floors of the east and south walls, with rounded head openings on the first floor and square heads on the second floor;
  - 18 large multi-pane wooden windows with thick muntins on the east wall;
  - Its deep cornice with delicate dentils separating the second and third floors.
- Frontenac Street 1931 & 1959 sections:
  - The three-storey 11 vertical-bay façade of brick construction capped by limestone coping broken regularly by limestone scuppers and sitting on a limestone foundation;
  - The consistent fenestration pattern, including 9 multi-pane window openings per bay (excluding entrance bays);
  - Its two Collegiate Gothic style projecting limestone entrances with glazed Oak doors with decorative transoms and including their own consistent fenestration patterns, including two sets of tripartite windows;
  - The sign reading "Kingston Collegiate Vocational Institute" on the parapet wall over the third floor window in the main entrance bay; and
  - The two original cast-iron sconces flanking the smaller entrance on Frontenac Street.
## Heritage Kingston

### Summary of Input from the Technical Review Process

**P18-004-2020**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heritage Kingston Members</th>
<th>Comments Enclosed</th>
<th>No Comments Provided</th>
<th>No Response Received</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chair, Peter Gower</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Councilor Bridget Doherty</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Councilor Gary Oosterhof</td>
<td></td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane McFarlane</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donald Taylor</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer Demitor</td>
<td></td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthew McCartney</td>
<td></td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoe Harris</td>
<td></td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Hineman</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeremy St-Onge</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moya Dumville</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Date: February 5, 2020  
Form: Heritage Kingston Reviewer Form  
Reviewer Name: Peter Gower  
Application Type: Remove  
File Number: P18-004-2020  
Property Address: 235 FRONTENAC ST

Description of Proposal:

The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the entire city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018. The applicant is requesting heritage approval to permit the removal of four (4) portables from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are not noted as heritage attributes of the designating by-law (attached to the file).

Comments for Consideration on the Application:
I have no concerns with this application.

Recommended Conditions for the Application:
All care must be taken to do no damage to any heritage protected buildings on the site.
The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the entire city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018. The applicant is requesting heritage approval to permit the removal of four (4) portables from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are not noted as heritage attributes of the designating by-law (attached to the file).

Comments for Consideration on the Application:
No concerns.
Date: February 6, 2020
Form: Heritage Kingston Reviewer Form
Reviewer Name: Bridget Doherty
Application Type: Remove
File Number: P18-004-2020
Property Address: 235 FRONTENAC ST

Description of Proposal:

The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the entire city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018. The applicant is requesting heritage approval to permit the removal of four (4) portables from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are not noted as heritage attributes of the designating by-law (attached to the file).

Comments for Consideration on the Application:
No concerns at all. Will these sheds go to other schools or donated to Habitat for Humanity?
### Date: February 6, 2020

### Form: Heritage Kingston Reviewer Form

### Reviewer Name: Jeremy St-Onge

### Application Type: Remove

### File Number: P18-004-2020

### Property Address: 235 FRONTENAC ST

### Description of Proposal:

The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the entire city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018. The applicant is requesting heritage approval to permit the removal of four (4) portables from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are not noted as heritage attributes of the designating by-law (attached to the file).

### Comments for Consideration on the Application:

No cause for concern here. Would like to know what will be done with the portables after removal. My hope is they can be recycled and reused.
Date: February 6, 2020
Form: Heritage Kingston Reviewer Form
Reviewer Name: William Kelley Hineman
Application Type: Remove
File Number: P18-004-2020
Property Address: 235 FRONTENAC ST

The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the entire city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018. The applicant is requesting heritage approval to permit the removal of four (4) portables from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are not noted as heritage attributes of the designating by-law (attached to the file).

Comments for Consideration on the Application:

I have absolutely no issues with the removal of these structures.
The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the entire city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018. The applicant is requesting heritage approval to permit the removal of four (4) portables from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are not noted as heritage attributes of the designating by-law (attached to the file).

Comments for Consideration on the Application:

No comments, it all looks good and reasonable.
### Description of Proposal:

The subject property is located on the south side of Earl Street and includes the entire city block between Frontenac and Alfred Streets. The property includes Kingston Collegiate and Vocational Institute (KCVI), which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 2018. The applicant is requesting heritage approval to permit the removal of four (4) portables from the east side of the property facing Alfred Street. The portables are not noted as heritage attributes of the designating by-law (attached to the file).

### Comments for Consideration on the Application:

The portables do not contribute to the heritage attributes of the property but hopefully once removed can be re-used or re-purposed. The applicant should ensure that removal does not affect the existing trees along Alfred St.