



CITY OF KINGSTON
REPORT TO COUNCIL

Report No.: 12-177

TO: Mayor and Members of Council
FROM: Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services
RESOURCE STAFF: Wally Ferris, Director, Recreation & Leisure Services
DATE OF MEETING: May 15, 2012
SUBJECT: Award of RFP No. F31-CSG-RLS-2012-03
Full Design Services for Breakwater Park

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to award the contract for landscape architectural design services for Breakwater Park. Nineteen (19) submissions were received and staff is recommending that the contract be awarded to the highest scoring proposal based on the evaluation criteria.

Sufficient funds for these services have been previously approved by Council.

The proposal from Claude Cormier + Associés Inc. was not the lowest priced received. Section 3.4 iii) of the Purchasing By-Law requires that approval be sought by a separate report to Council when the lowest bid or proposal is not accepted.

RECOMMENDATION:

THAT RFP No. F31-CSG-RLS-2012-03 'Full Design Services for Breakwater Park' be awarded to Claude Cormier + Associés Inc. for \$222,594.00 plus applicable taxes; and

THAT Council authorize the Mayor and City Clerk to enter into an agreement with Claude Cormier + Associés Inc. in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

AUTHORIZING SIGNATURES:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer
--

CONSULTATION WITH THE FOLLOWING COMMISSIONERS:

Cynthia Beach, <i>Sustainability & Growth</i>	N/R
Denis Leger, <i>Transportation, Properties & Emergency Services</i>	N/R
Jim Keech, <i>President and CEO, Utilities Kingston</i>	N/R

(N/R indicates consultation not required)

OPTIONS/DISCUSSION:

Breakwater Park is a prominent urban waterfront park in the core of the City. It is located in the Sydenham District Neighbourhood and in close proximity to Queen’s University and Kingston General Hospital. It is highly used by local residents and visitors to the area.

The park is situated along a primary tourist route into the historic downtown of the City. The park and its waterfront views are important to the image and culture of the municipality. Upgrades are required to improve the utility and experience of the space as well as providing enhancements to accessibility. The revitalization of Breakwater Park will create a functional and distinct urban waterfront park.

An RFP for the Full Design Services for Breakwater Park was issued on January 12, 2012 that included public consultation, conceptual design development, construction contract documents and contract administration services.

Nineteen proposals were received, having prices ranging from \$93,000.00 to \$469,760.00 (exclusive of tax). Proposals were received from:

- | | |
|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 1. AECOM | 2. Balmori Associates |
| 3. Basterfield & Associates | 4. Claude Cormier + Associés Inc. |
| 5. Corush Sunderland Wright | 6. duToit Allsopp Hillier |
| 7. Ekistics Planning & Design | 8. G. O’Connor Consultants |
| 9. Janet Rosenberg + Associates | 10. LandInc |
| 11. MBTW Watchorn | 12. MMM Group Ltd |
| 13. The Planning Partnership | 14. Scott Wentworth Landscape Group |
| 15. Stantec Consulting Ltd | 16. Steven Popovich Associates Inc. |
| 17. Terraplan | 18. Thinc Design |
| 19. Quinn Design Associates | |

Proposals were evaluated on demonstrated relevant experience on waterfront park projects. Six (6) submissions were shortlisted, reviewed by a cross departmental team and scored on the following criteria set out in the RFP:

• Qualifications and Experience	35
• Financial Proposal (scoring formula= lowest bid÷ proposal price x 25)	25
• Experience on Projects of Similar Scale & Complexity	15
• Methodology & Schedule: demonstrated understanding of project	15
• Value –added services	5
• Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act Adherence, section C.3	5
Total	100 Points

After the initial evaluation, four (4) of the six proposals were closely ranked as top submissions with some data contained in the proposals requiring clarification. As a best practice in the

evaluation exercise, all four firms were requested to submit clarification on the roles and responsibilities of the project team, experience on projects of similar scale and complexity and further demonstrate understanding of the scope of services requested. Higher scores were awarded to firms with lead design staff that demonstrated higher experience on waterfront park projects of a similar scale and complexity. The proposed hours allocated to design services for principal staff as well as relevant experience of support personnel was considered in the scoring.

The table below provides final scores of the top six submissions.

RFP Submission (top six)	Total Score
Claude Cormier + Associés Inc.	72.0
Janet Rosenberg + Associates	67.6
Thinc Design	65.2
Planning Partnership	64.9
Balmori Associates	57.4
Corush Sutherland Wright	56.0

The top ranked proposal was from Claude Cormier + Associés Inc. The price of the proposal is \$222,594.00 plus applicable taxes. It was not the lowest priced proposal received.

Claude Cormier + Associés Inc. submitted the most complete and comprehensive proposal. Clear understanding of the complexity of the project and relevant experience and qualifications to successfully complete the revitalization of Breakwater Park were demonstrated. This firm held the lead design responsibility on many significant and complex waterfront park projects and is nationally recognized for creating iconic and functional public spaces.

The second ranked proposal was from Janet Rosenberg + Associates. This firm demonstrated a sophistication of waterfront park experience but proposed significantly less principal staff participation for the project.

The third ranked proposal was from Thinc Design. This firm demonstrated a depth of team member experience but did not demonstrate sufficient firm lead design responsibility experience.

The fourth ranked proposal was from The Planning Partnership. This firm demonstrated relevant firm experience but did not demonstrate sufficient relevant experience of their proposed lead personnel.

May 15, 2012

- Page 5 -

EXISTING POLICY/BY LAW:

By-Law 2000-134 A By-Law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures

ACCESSIBILITY CONSIDERATIONS:

Accessibility criteria have been incorporated in the evaluation criteria of the RFP.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS:

Sufficient funds exist for these services in the Council approved Recreation and Leisure Services Department capital budget.

CONTACTS:

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services 613-546-4291 ext. 1231

OTHER CITY OF KINGSTON STAFF CONSULTED:

Wally Ferris, Director Recreation and Leisure Services	613-546-4291 ext. 1302
Neal Unsworth, Manager, Parks Development	613-546-4291 ext. 1811
Kristine Hebert, Parks & Open Space Planning Coordinator	613-546-4291 ext. 1256
Alan McLeod, Senior Legal Counsel, Legal Services	613-546-4291 ext. 1237
Janis Morrison, Purchasing Coordinator, Financial Services	613-546-4291 ext. 2229

EXHIBITS ATTACHED:

Exhibit 'A' Precedent Images from Claude Cormier + Associés Inc. Proposal

Exhibit 'A'
Precedent Images



1. Sugar Beach – Toronto Waterfront (2007-2010) – *Winning Scheme of an International Design Competition*

Client: *Toronto Waterfront*
VP Design – Mr. Chris Glaisek 416-214-1344 ext 245
Project Director – James Roche 416-214-1344 ext 260

Team: *Claude Cormier + Associés – Design and Project Leading Firm + Coordination*
The Planning Partnership Limited – Toronto Office Correspondent



2. HfO – Toronto Waterfront (2003-2007) – Winning Scheme of an International Design Competition

Client: City of Toronto
Mr. Bob Duguid – Parks 416-392-1925

Team : Janet Rosenberg + Associates Project leading firm (JR+A) – Lead Project
Claude Cormier Architectes Paysagistes Inc. – Design Lead
Hariri Pontarini Architects – Architecture



3. Old Port of Montreal – Master Plan (2005-2009) – Composed with five Distinct sub Master Plans

Client: *The Old Port of Montreal*
CEO – Madame Claude Benoit 514-283-8219
Project Director – Mr. Jean Lague 514-283-8423

Team: *Claude Cormier Architectes Paysagistes Inc. – Landscape Architecture and Urban Design*



4. Urban Beach Old Port of Montreal (2009-2012) – Opening June 2012

Client: *The Old Port of Montreal*
CEO – Madame Claude Benoit 514-283-8219
Project Director – Mr. Jean Lague 514-283-8423

Team: *Claude Cormier + Associés – Landscape Architecture and Urban Design*



5. Dorchester Square Phase 1, Montreal (2008-2010) – Master Plan for Dorchester Square and Place du Canada

Client: Ville de Montreal, Quebec Ministry of Culture
City of Montreal Park Director – Mr. Pierre Bouchard 514-872-1457
City of Montreal Culture – Madame Céline Topp 514-872-3111

Team: Consortium Groupe Cardinal Hardy + Claude Cormier Architectes Paysagistes Inc.



Circa 1760



Quilt inspiration

Awards / 1999 Canadian Society of Landscape Architects Regional Honor
1999 Canadian Society of Landscape Architects National Merit
Collaboration / Groupe Cardinal Hardy

7. Place d'Youville – Old Montreal (1997-1999) – Winning Scheme of a Provincial Design Competition

Client: Ville de Montreal, Quebec Ministry of Culture

Team: Groupe Cardinal Hardy – Project Leader
Claude Cormier Architectes Paysagistes Inc. – Design Lead