



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 15-135**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services
Resource Staff: Paige Agnew, Director, Planning, Building and Licensing Services
Date of Meeting: January 6, 2015
Subject: Consultant Selection and Award of Contract for Cultural Heritage Property Evaluation and Conservation Project

Executive Summary:

On October 1, 2014, the Planning and Development issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) inviting proposals from firms/teams interested in undertaking a cultural heritage evaluation of approximately 150 properties within the City and to recommend an appropriate level of *Ontario Heritage Act* conservation (i.e. designation, listing or no action). This work is intended to assist staff in moving forward a number of heritage property reviews, in order to more accurately reflect the amount of built heritage resources in the City of Kingston.

The RFP closed on October 22, 2014 with five (5) firms/teams submitting proposals. The highest scoring firm (Archaeological Research Associates Limited) is recommended for this contract.

The cost of the undertaking will be \$107,310.45 including all consulting fees, disbursements and HST. The funds for the study are included in the approved capital budget. It is anticipated that the study will be completed by the end of 2015.

In compliance with the Purchasing By-Law Number 2000-134, staff is required to present a recommendation to City Council for their approval to award this contract as this proposal was not the lowest cost proposal received.

January 6, 2015

Page 2 of 5

Recommendation:

That Archaeological Research Associates Limited, be retained to undertake the Cultural Heritage Property Evaluation and Conservation Project (F31-CS-PD-2014-04); and

That the cost of the study be established at \$107,310.45, including all consulting fees, disbursements and HST; and

That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to enter into an agreement, to the satisfaction of the Director of Legal Services, for the purpose of engaging Archaeological Research Associates Limited to undertake the preparation of the Cultural Heritage Property Evaluation and Conservation Project.

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Cynthia Beach, Corporate & Strategic Initiatives	Not required
Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services	Not required
Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston	Not required
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required

January 6, 2015

Page 3 of 5

Options/Discussion:**Background**

The City of Kingston is well known for its cultural heritage resources and its part in Canadian history. Cultural Heritage plays a key role in the City's identity, quality of life, and contributes to its economic prosperity. The City's Heritage Properties Register includes approximately 1200 properties of cultural heritage value and interest. However, this does not represent the full range of cultural heritage resources within the City of Kingston. Given the important role that cultural heritage resources play in Kingston, the City is initiating the Cultural Heritage Property Evaluation and Conservation Project.

Staff have compiled a list of approximately 150 properties of potential cultural heritage value, from various sources, for review and evaluation by the consultant team. A Request for Proposal was issued on October 1, 2014 in order to retain the services of a consulting firm specializing in cultural heritage to assist in compiling the necessary research on properties of interest and increasing the number of protected heritage properties on the City's Heritage Properties Register.

The consultant will be task with the following main tasks:

1. To conduct background research and to evaluate properties against *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and recommend which properties should be listed or designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;
2. To prepare Statements of Significance for all relevant properties, including identifying specific heritage attributes for each property;
3. To undertake the preparation of the municipal designation by-laws;
4. To present the final by-laws to the Municipal Heritage Committee.

The public consultation associated with this project will follow the best practices expected for any new or updated designation by-law. The consultant team will connect with the Historic Properties Research Working Group at various stages of the project. The consultant team may also be required to meet with other relevant stakeholders, such as affected property owners. It is expected that the consultant team will present the draft by-laws/reports to the Heritage Committee.

This project will provide Planning and Development staff with assistance in completing a number of outstanding designation evaluations, and add a number of additional properties to the City's Heritage Register to more accurately represent and conserve the wealth of built heritage resources within the City of Kingston. Once awarded, it is estimated that the project will be completed within twelve months.

January 6, 2015

Page 4 of 5

Evaluation of Proposals

The Request for Proposals (RFP) established an evaluation framework that assigned a weighted value to each of the following eight (8) elements of the proposal submissions:

- 1) Approach to the project (20 points);
- 2) Consultant team experience and capability (25 points);
- 3) Demonstrated knowledge of relevant policies and legislation (10 points);
- 4) Demonstrated knowledge of the City of Kingston and its heritage programs (5 points);
- 5) Final product (10 points);
- 6) Accessibility Standards (5 points);
- 7) Compliance with RFP requirements and proposal submission (5 points); and
- 8) Project cost (20 points).

The RFP closed on October 22, 2014 with five (5) firms/teams submitting proposals. The five consulting firms/teams that submitted proposals were evaluated through an internal review process which included staff from Planning and Development.

Firms/Teams	Ranking	Cost
Archaeological Research Associates Ltd. (ARA Heritage)	80.5	\$107,310.45
Laurie Smith Consulting	75	\$189,486.70
MacNaughton Hermsen Britton Clarkson Planning Limited (MHBC)	74	\$62,594.94
Mark Brandt Architect and Associates Inc. (MTBA)	71.5	\$336,488.77
URS Canada Inc.	76.5	\$346,432.06

Archaeological Research Associates Limited (ARA Heritage) provided a clear proposal that best met the terms of the Request for Proposal. The firm demonstrated in its proposal that it has a full understanding of the requirements of the project and its objectives. The team at ARA Heritage has experience doing similar projects in the City of Burlington, the Town of Halton Hills and the City of Brampton, among others. The ARA Heritage team also includes a dedicated Heritage Researcher, Writer and a Cartographer in addition to the lead Project Manager.

The cost of the study will be \$107,310.45 including all consulting fees, disbursements and HST. This cost was the second lowest estimate of all of the submitted proposals. The budget for this project is part of the approved capital budget.

January 6, 2015

Page 5 of 5

The Planning and Development Division will be overseeing the Cultural Heritage Property Evaluation and Conservation Project and the anticipated completion date is the end of 2015.

Existing Policy/By Law:

Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, C. O.18. (Province of Ontario)

Notice Provisions:

N/A

Accessibility Considerations:

N/A

Financial Considerations:

The costs associated with this project are included in the approved Planning and Development Division capital budget.

Contacts:

Paige Agnew, Director, Planning, Building and Licensing Services 613-546-4291 extension 3252

Cherie Mills, Manager, Policy Planning 613-546-4291 extension 3289

Ryan Leary, Senior Planner, Heritage 613-546-4291 extension 3233

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

N/A

Exhibits Attached:

N/A