An Application for Alteration under Section 33 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, File Number P18-400-021-2015, has been submitted to request approval to create a new entrance door to a basement suite in the location of an existing window underneath the front porch. The proposed entrance into the stone foundation will incorporate the stone lintel and window jamb treatment, and the proposed wood door will include detailing in keeping with the existing building.

Staff supports the approval of the proposed alteration subject to the conditions outlined herein.

**Recommendation:**

That it be recommended to Council that the alteration to the designated property at 55 West Street, be approved in accordance with details described in Application Number P18-400-021-2015, which was deemed complete on April 9, 2015; and

That the approval include:

1. Removing the existing basement window and lengthening the existing window opening within the stone foundation to accommodate an entrance door, while retaining the original width of the window opening to retain the existing stone lintel and to replicate and extend the existing stone window jamb treatment;

2. Creating a new stairway and landing in front of the proposed basement access door;

3. Removing the arched lattice at the north side of the existing front porch to provide access to the proposed basement entrance;
May 4, 2015

Page 2 of 6

4. Installing a new wooden entrance door with upper light and lower moulded panels in proportions in keeping with the remainder of the building (i.e. the main door);

5. If feasible, retain the segmentally arched form at the head of the new opening at the side of the porch matching that of the windows; and

That the approval of the alteration be subject to the following conditions:

1. That a building permit be obtained for the proposed scope of work;

2. Include a handrail on the proposed basement access stairs to meet Building Code requirements;

3. In lengthening the opening, undertake the removal of the stone and reinstatement as required to form the jambs of the opening with great care with the new section of door jambs replicating (or closely resembling) the treatment of the original jambs above. Salvage the stone removed for use elsewhere in the project;

4. Photographically document the existing condition, the construction process and the final appearance of the opening and associated changes to the porch and submit to City heritage planning staff for record-keeping;

5. All masonry work shall be conducted in accordance with the City’s Policy on Masonry Restoration in Heritage Buildings;

6. Ensure proper drainage at the new landing in front of the new entrance;

7. That the project and any associated below grade disturbance be preceded by the completion of a minimum of a Stage 1 Archaeological Assessment, as the property is located in an “Archaeologically Sensitive Area” as per the Council approved Archaeology Master Plan;

8. That the project is completed in accordance with the Environmental construction notes provided to the applicant;

9. That the proposed entrance may not encroach into the municipal boulevard; and

10. An encroachment permit is required if the applicant needs to occupy the sidewalk for any reason (scaffolding, ladders, garbage bins, etc.).
Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINALLY SIGNED BY COMMISSIONER

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services

ORIGINALLY SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Cynthia Beach, Corporate & Strategic Initiatives
Denis Leger, Transportation, Facilities & Emergency Services
Jim Keech, President and CEO, Utilities Kingston
Desiree Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer

Not required
Not required
Not required
Not required
Options/Discussion:

Proposal/Background
The portion of the existing building known as 55 West Street was constructed in 1877 through a
design by architect Robert Gage. The existing building is a two-storey, three bay, brick dwelling,
built on a high hammer-dressed stone foundation.

The proposal is currently the subject of a zoning by-law amendment application to permit a one
storey addition to the rear of the structure and permit an existing basement apartment.
Recommendation to the Planning Committee is expected to proceed for consideration at the
conclusion of the heritage permit process. The proposal represents an amendment to a previous
application for an addition (P18-400-037-2014), which was approved by the Municipal Heritage
Committee and Council in May 2014.

The application consists of a proposal to provide front door access to a basement suite
underneath the front porch. The proposed door opening will lengthen an existing window
opening and will involve excavating around the extended window opening below and adjacent to
the porch to allow for a stair down to a new landing in front of the door. The existing stone lintel
above the basement window, to be lengthened, will be retained. In addition, the stone window
jamb treatment will be replicated and extended the length of the proposed door. The proposed
wood door will include an upper light with lower moulded panels, with proportions intended to
reflect details on the existing dwelling.

Reasons for Designation
The property was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in 1984 through By-Law
Number 84-257. The reasons for designation are as follows:

“Architect Robert Gage’s design for this 1877 brick dwelling makes it a compatible addition to an
important streetscape facing City Park.”

The subject property is also located in the Old Sydenham Heritage Conservation District, which
has been approved by Council but is currently undergoing a public appeal period, expiring on
May 11, 2015.

Previous Approvals
1987: rear addition
P18-400-024-2004 replacement of porch
P18-400-027-2014 addition to 55 and 53 West Street

Comments from Internal Departments
The following internal departments were circulated on the technical circulation of this
application:

- Building: A building permit is required for the proposed scope of work.
- Property Standards: No property standards cases regarding this address.
- Fire & Rescue: No comments received.
- Engineering: No comments received.
• Environment: Include the City’s “General Construction Notes – Environment” on one or more of the final construction drawings.

Built Heritage Analysis
The application includes a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIS) Addendum prepared by André Scheinman, which provides an update to the previous Heritage Impact Assessment submitted regarding the addition to 55 and 53 West Street (P18-400-027-2014). The HIS notes that below grade apartment access was common in the 19th and early 20th century and represents a traditional and reasonable apartment access solution in this context. The HIS also includes a number of recommendations to mitigate the proposed intervention, including the following:

• In lengthening the opening, to undertake the removal of the stone and reinstatement as required to form the jambs of the opening with great care with the new section of door jambs replicating (or closely resembling) the treatment of the original jambs above. Salvage the stone removed for use elsewhere in the project. Follow or exceed the City’s Heritage Masonry Guidelines.
• Photographically document the existing condition, the construction process and the final appearance of the opening and associated changes to the porch, etc.
• If at all possible, retain the segmentally arched form at the head of the new opening at the side of the porch matching that of the windows (it is understood that this would likely have to be a reworked version of the current treatment due to space limitations).
• Ensure proper drainage at the new landing in front of the new entrance.

Heritage staff concurs with the above-noted recommendations and have incorporated them into permit conditions.

The applicable entry in the Kingston Volumes of Buildings of Architectural and Historic Significance (Volume 5, page 270) describes the significance of the scale and symmetry of this brick dwelling in relation to the streetscape and also notes that the existing dwelling is built on a “very high hammed-dressed stone foundation”. The brick dwellings along West Street between King Street and Wellington Street maintain a similar scale and high stone foundations. While there are no other properties along the block with basement access under the porch, there are a number of such entrances in the Sydenham District (i.e. Bagot Street at West Street). Furthermore, the proposed entrance opening works incorporates an existing window opening, which lessens the overall intervention to the fabric of the foundation. The proposed wooden door is sympathetic to the style and detail found elsewhere on the building.

Conclusion
Staff recommends that Ontario Heritage Act Application Number P18-400-021-2015 be approved, subject to conditions outlined herein. There are no objections from a perspective of built heritage and no concerns have been noted by the relevant internal departments.

Existing Policy/By-Law:


By-Law Number 2013-141 Procedural By-Law for Heritage
Notice Provisions:

Pursuant to Section 33(3) of the *Ontario Heritage Act (OHA)*, notice of receipt of a complete application has been served on the applicant. As per Section 33(4)(b) of the *OHA*, notice of the decision must be served on the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust.

Accessibility Considerations:

Not applicable

Financial Considerations:

Not applicable

Contacts:

Paige Agnew, Director, Planning, Building & Licensing Services 613-546-4291 extension 3252

Julie Salter-Keane, Manager, Development Approvals 613-546-4291 extension 1163

Amy Didrikson, Heritage Planner, Development Approvals 613-546-4291 extension 3288

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

The application has been circulated to internal departments for review and comment.

Exhibits Attached:

- **Exhibit A** Heritage Application Form
- **Exhibit B** Rendering of Proposed Entrance
- **Exhibit C** Elevation and Floor Plans
- **Exhibit D** Applicant Photos
- **Exhibit E** Heritage Impact Assessment Addendum
APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT UNDER THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT

The accuracy and completeness of this application will assist staff in processing your application in a timely manner.

DATE FILED: APPLICATION: P18-400-021-2015

The undersigned hereby applies for a Heritage Permit pursuant to Section 33/34 and 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act, RSO 1990, c.18 for alteration or demolition as described in this application.

1. NAME OF OWNER: Jack and Helen Cooper
2. LOCATION OF PROPERTY:
   CIVIC ADDRESS: 55 West Street
   LOT NO. and REGISTERED PLAN NO.: Part of Lots 12 and 11, Reg. Plan No. C.25
   ASSESSMENT ROLL NO.: 1011 010 030 028 00 0000
3. NAME OF AGENT (If any): Colbourne & Kembel, Architect Inc.

Notice of Collection: Personal information, as defined by the Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act (MFIPPA), is collected on this Ontario Heritage Act application under the authority of the Municipal Act, 2001, and in accordance with MFIPPA. Personal information collected on the application form will be used to assist in making a decision on this matter. All names, addresses, opinions and comments will be made available for public disclosure. Questions regarding this collection should be forwarded to the Director, Planning, Building & Licensing Serv, City of Kingston, 216 Ontario Street, Kingston, Ontario, K7L 2Z3, telephone (613) 546-4291, Extension 1844.

Revised September 2013
APPLICATION FOR HERITAGE PERMIT

4. BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF WORK TO BE UNDERTAKEN:

New entrance door to basement suite to be installed in the location of an existing window underneath the front porch

Description of work attached: Yes ☐ No ☐

The building is: Existing ☐ Proposed ☐

Request is to: Alter ☐ Demolish ☐ Remove ☐

5. CONCURRENT APPLICATIONS:

If yes, please list:

Current Application for re-zoning in progress.

6. DECLARATION:

I (we) the undersigned solemnly declare that all of the statements contained in this application for (property description/address) 55 West Street and all the supporting documents are true, and I (we), make this solemn declaration conscientiously believing it to be true and complete, and knowing that it is of the same force and effect as if made under oath, by virtue of the CANADA EVIDENCE ACT. I agree to allow the Corporation of the City of Kingston, its employees and agents to enter upon the subject land for the purpose of conducting a site inspection as may be necessary to process this application.

SIGNATURE OF OWNER(S) SIGNATURE OF AGENT

Please print name(s) legibly Please print name legibly

Heather Clark Kembel Date 2015-05-19

If the application is signed by an agent, the owner’s written authorization for the agent to act must accompany this application.

Revised September 2013
EXHIBIT C

GROUND FLOOR

EXISTING GROUND FLOOR AREA: 52 m²
ADDITION: 34 m²
PROPOSED FLOOR AREA: 86 m²

PROJECT No. 1901
DRAWING

ARCHITECTS INC.

LOCATION
55 WEST STREET KINGSTON, ONTARIO

SCALE 1:125

DATE 2013.01.15 REVISED 02-20
Exhibit C
March 10, 2015.

Heather Kembel
Principal
CKA
(sent by email)

Dear Heather:

Re: 53-55 West Street, Kingston - Proposed Addition/Renovations HIS – Addendum

As I understand it comments from the city planning department have led to the proposed relocation of the basement apartment entrance to the West Street elevation directly beneath the main door and the landing of the front porch where a window currently exists.

The proposal calls for the lengthening of the window opening within the stone foundation to accommodate an entrance door. The original width of the opening would be retained allowing for the retention of the original stone lintel. The creation of this entrance would entail excavation around the extended opening below and adjacent to the porch to allow for a stair down to a new landing in front of the door. Also the removal of the arched lattice at the north side of the porch would be required. The door itself is proposed to generally echo that of the main door in that it would have a glazed longer upper panel above a shorter solid panel.

Comments:

This approach to access for a below grade apartment was often used in the 19th and early 20th century (Fig. 1-2) and is a reasonable and traditional solution to the design problem at hand. The ability to work with an existing lintelled opening greatly lessens the impact (both structural and visual) to the historic stone foundation.

However the following are further recommendations to mitigate the proposed intervention:

- In lengthening the opening undertake the removal of the stone and reinstatement as required to form the jambs of the opening with great care with the new section of door jambs replicating (or closely resembling) the treatment of the original jambs above. Salvage the stone removed for use elsewhere in the project. Follow or exceed the City’s Heritage Masonry Guidelines.
Photographically document the existing condition, the construction process and the final appearance of the opening and associated changes to the porch etc..

If at all possible retain the segmentally arched form at the head of the new opening at the side of the porch matching that of the windows. (It is understood that this would likely have to be a reworked version of the current treatment due to space limitations.)

Ensure proper drainage at the new landing in front of the new entrance.

Fig. 1: Basement entrance at 47 Wellington St.

Fig. 2: Detail of basement entrance

Sincerely,

André Scheinman

350 Wellington Street, Suite 305, Kingston, Ontario K7K 7J7
e-mail: andre.preserve@gmail.com  tel: 613-546-1121